## 2019 <br> Housing Supply Report

## May 16, 2019

## Board Members

Chair:
David Reiss
Public Members:
Cecilia Joza • Alex Schwartz
German Tejeda • May Yu

## Owner Members:

Patti Stone • Scott Walsh
Tenant Members:
Sheila Garcia • Leah Goodridge

## Staff Members

Executive Director:
Andrew McLaughlin

## Research Director:

Brian Hoberman
Deputy Research Director:
Danielle Burger
Office Manager:
Charmaine Superville

## New York City Rent Guidelines Board

1 Centre Street, Suite 2210, New York, NY 10007 • 212-669-7480 • nyc.gov/rgb

## New York City Rent Guidelines Board 2019 Housing Supply Report

## 04 Introduction

04 Overview

04 New York City's Housing Inventory

## 06 Changes in the Housing Inventory

Tax-Delinquent Property
| 4 Demolitions

I 5 Summary

## I7 Appendices

## What's New

- Permits for 20,910 new dwelling units were issued in NYC in 2018, a $5.5 \%$ decrease from the prior year.
$\checkmark$ The number of new housing units completed in 2018 increased 4.5\% over the prior year, to 26,992.
$\checkmark$ City-sponsored programs spurred 32,203 new housing starts in FY 2018, 29\% of which were newly constructed units.
$\square$ The number of housing units newly receiving 421-a exemptions increased $36.0 \%$ in 2018 , to 28,292 .
$\checkmark$ The number of "Certificates of No Harassment," which allow for the conversion of SRO housing, decreased by $9.8 \%$, to 83.
$\square$ There was a $29.0 \%$ increase in the number of co-op or condo units accepted in 2018, to 10,784 units contained in 289 plans.
$\checkmark$ The number of housing units newly receiving J-51 abatements and exemptions increased $30.3 \%$ in 2018, to 29,815 .

Demolitions were up in 2018, increasing by $9.6 \%$, to 1,888 buildings.

## Introduction

Section 26-510(b) of the Rent Stabilization Law requires the Rent Guidelines Board (RGB) to consider the "over-all supply of housing accommodations and over-all vacancy rates" and "such other data as may be made available to it." To assist the Board in meeting this obligation, the RGB research staff produces an annual Housing Supply Report, which reports on current conditions in the housing market, including vacancy and overcrowding rates, new housing production, co-op and condo conversions, demolitions, housing created through tax incentives, and governmentsponsored housing starts.

## Overview

Between 2017 and 2018 there was a 5.5\% decrease in the number of permits issued for new housing units, falling to 20,910 . The number of completed housing units rose during 2018 , increasing $4.5 \%$ to

26,992 units. Following five consecutive years of decrease, the number of units newly receiving 421-a benefits rose for the second consecutive year, increasing 36.0\% from 2017 levels. The number of units newly accepted in co-op and condo plans rose by $29.0 \%$, with the number of plans rising by $3.6 \%$. Rehabilitation of housing units under the J-51 tax abatement and exemption program also rose during 2018, up $30.3 \%$. The number of demolitions rose by $9.6 \%$ during 2018. As of 2017, a tight housing market also remains in New York City (NYC), with a Citywide rental vacancy rate of $3.63 \%$ and $11.5 \%$ of all rental housing considered overcrowded.

## New York City's Housing Inventory

Most New Yorkers live in multi-family rental housing rather than owning homes. According to the 2017 Housing and Vacancy Survey (HVS), ${ }^{1}$ rental units comprise $62.9 \%$ of NYC's available housing stock, a far greater share than the nationwide average of $36.1 \%{ }^{2}$ NYC in 2017 had a total of 3,469,240

Number of Renter and Owner Units

New York City's Housing Stock Is Predominantly Renter-Occupied


Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, 2017 New York City Housing and Vacancy Survey Note:Above figures exclude 247,977 vacant units that are not available for sale or rent.
housing units, the largest housing stock since the first HVS was conducted in 1965. NYC's housing is not only distinguished by the size of its rental housing stock, but unlike most cities, the bulk of rental units are rent regulated. Of the $2,183,064$ occupied and vacant rental units reported in the most recent HVS, $42.9 \%$ were unregulated, or "free market." The remaining units were rent regulated, including pre-war (pre-47) rent stabilized (31.7\%), post-war (post-46) rent stabilized (12.5\%), rent controlled (1.0\%), or regulated under various other ${ }^{3}$ types of programs (11.8\%). (See pie chart on the previous page.)

The HVS also indicated that NYC's housing market remains tight, finding a Citywide rental vacancy rate of $3.63 \%$ in 2017, below the $5 \%$ threshold required for rent regulation to continue under State law. This translates into the availability of just 79,190 vacant units out of almost 2.2 million rental units Citywide. The vacancy rate ranged from a low of $2.71 \%$ in the Bronx to a high of $4.73 \%$ in Manhattan. The Brooklyn vacancy rate was $3.28 \%$,
and the Queens rate was 3.50\%. The sample size in Staten Island was too small to permit calculation of an accurate vacancy rate. ${ }^{4}$

Vacancy rates also varied by rent regulation status. Both post-war and pre-war stabilized units had low vacancy rates, at $1.21 \%$ and $2.40 \%$, respectively. Stabilized vacancy rates on the whole were $2.06 \%$, while private, non-regulated units were vacant at a $6.07 \%$ rate.

The frequency of crowding also varied by rent regulation status. Overall, $11.5 \%$ of all rental housing in NYC in 2017 was overcrowded (defined as more than one person per room, on average) and 4.5\% was severely overcrowded (defined as an average of more than 1.5 persons per room). Post-war stabilized housing was more crowded than pre-war, with $13.4 \%$ of units overcrowded and $6.6 \%$ severely overcrowded, while $12.9 \%$ of pre-war units were overcrowded, and $5.1 \%$ were severely overcrowded. Overall, $13.1 \%$ of rent stabilized housing was overcrowded and $5.5 \%$ was severely overcrowded. By comparison, in non-regulated

Units Issued New Housing Permits, 1994-2018, in Thousands
Number of Permits Issued for New Construction of Housing Decreases by More Than 5\%


Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, Manufacturing and Construction Division Building Permits Branch
housing, $11.3 \%$ was overcrowded and $4.2 \%$ was severely overcrowded.

## Changes in the Housing Inventory

Housing supply grows, contracts, and changes in a variety of ways - new construction, substantial rehabilitation, conversion from rental housing to owner housing, and conversion from nonresidential buildings into residential use.

## Housing Permits

The number of permits authorized for new construction is a measure of how many new housing units will be completed and ready for occupancy, typically within three years, depending on the type of housing structure. In 2018, permits newly issued for housing units fell for just the third time in the past

## Residential Building Permits, 2018

Total Number of Permits Issued in 2018 and Percentage Change

From 2017, by Borough


Source: U.S.Bureau of the Census, Manufacturing and Construction Division - Building Permits Branch
ten years. Following an increase of $36.0 \%$ in 2017 (to 22,131 units), permits were issued in 2018 for 20,910 units of new housing, a decrease of $5.5 \%$ from $2017 .{ }^{5}$ (See graph on the previous page.)

Permits fell by double digits in every borough except Brooklyn, where they rose $37.8 \%$, to 8,445 units. Permits in the Bronx fell by the greatest proportion, decreasing $31.5 \%$, to 3,698 units. Newly issued permits also fell in Manhattan, by $25.5 \%$ (to 3,584 units); in Staten Island, by 11.5\% (to 606 units); and by $10.3 \%$ in Queens (to 4,577 units). (See Appendix 1 and the map on this page.)

Permits for new housing units fell despite the average building size increasing. While the average size of buildings receiving permits rose 9.3\% between 2017 and 2018 (from 13.2 units to 14.5 units), the number of buildings being newly permitted fell by a greater proportion, $13.6 \%$.

On a quarterly basis in 2018, permits fell by the greatest proportion in the first quarter, with issued permits decreasing by $18.5 \%$. Permits also fell by $3.6 \%$ in the second quarter, before beginning to rise, increasing by $0.6 \%$ in the third quarter and $2.3 \%$ in the fourth quarter. For historical permit information by quarter, see Appendix 3.

The most recently available data, from the first quarter of 2019, showed that newly issued permits were up as compared to the same period of the prior year, with increases in three of the five boroughs. The number of permits issued in NYC increased from 5,170 in the first quarter of 2018 to 6,329 during the first quarter of 2019, a $22.4 \%$ increase. While permits fell $21.8 \%$ in Manhattan and 29.0\% in the Bronx, they rose by 30.3\% in Staten Island; 30.7\% in Brooklyn; and $153.1 \%$ in Queens. Although there was a decrease of $6.0 \%$ in the number of buildings newly permitted during this quarter, units newly permitted rose because the average building size rose, increasing from 14.2 units to 18.5 units.

Permit data can also be analyzed more deeply by looking at the reported size of the buildings receiving permits. In 2018, a total of 1,446 buildings received permits (containing a total of 20,910 housing units). Citywide, $28.8 \%$ of these buildings were single-family, $28.1 \%$ were two-family, $9.0 \%$ were three- or four-family structures, and $34.1 \%$

Residential Building Permits, 2018

were buildings with five-or-more units. In 2018, $92.1 \%$ of all permits issued Citywide were for units in five-family or greater buildings (a total of 19,266 units), with the average five-family or greater building containing 39 units for the City as a whole, and 64 units in Manhattan (both decreases from the prior year). As the graph on this page illustrates, almost all building permits in Manhattan were for the largest buildings, while in Staten Island virtually all permits were for either one- or two-family buildings. Building size was more evenly distributed in the Bronx and Brooklyn (and to a lesser extent in Queens). (See Appendix 2.)

## Housing Completions

This report also examines the number of units completed in the City each year, indicative of what housing actually enters the market in a particular year. In 2018, an estimated 26,992 new housing units were completed, a $4.5 \%$ increase from $2017 .{ }^{6}$ Completions rose in three of the five boroughs, rising by the greatest proportion in the Bronx, which
rose $78.2 \%$ (to 4,761 units). Completions also rose in Staten Island, up $28.6 \%$ (to 863 units); and Queens, up $25.3 \%$ (to 6,318 units); Completions declined in Brooklyn, down 15.2\% (to 9,378 units); and Manhattan, down $11.2 \%$ (to 5,672 units). Citywide, $92.9 \%$ of the newly completed units were in fivefamily or greater buildings, down from $93.3 \%$ in the prior year. The average size of completed buildings, by borough, ranged from 1.8 units per building in Staten Island, to 13.4 units in Queens; 20.2 units in Brooklyn; 36.6 units in the Bronx; and 82.2 units in Manhattan. ${ }^{7}$ (See Appendix 4 for a historical breakdown of completions by borough.)

## City-Sponsored Construction

Housing is created and preserved in part through publicly funded sources, including programs sponsored by the NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) and the NYC Housing Development Corporation (HDC). HPD's Office of Development operates a number of programs that develop affordable housing for lowand moderate-income New Yorkers. Programs include the Extremely Low and Low-Income Affordability Program, which is HPD's multi-family new construction housing initiative, financed through both public and private sources; the Affordable Neighborhood Cooperative Program, which provides very low interest loans for the rehabilitation of buildings into affordable cooperatives for low and moderate-income households; and the Multifamily Housing Rehabilitation Loan Program, which provides rehabilitation loans at a maximum 3\% interest for the replacement of major building systems. HDC operates some of the same programs as HPD, in addition to programs such as the Mitchell-Lama Repair Loan Program, which offers loans to MitchellLama owners in order to make needed capital improvements, and the Preservation Program, which provides tax-exempt bond financing to affordable housing developments with at least 50 units.

In May of 2014, Mayor Bill de Blasio announced details of his ten-year, $\$ 41$ billion plan to build and/or preserve 200,000 units of affordable housing.
"Housing New York: A Five-Borough, Ten-Year Plan" projected that $60 \%$ of the units would be preservations, and $40 \%$ would be new construction. The majority, $58 \%$, were slated for "low-income" residents (defined at the plan's inception as $\$ 42,000-$ $\$ 67,000$ for a family of four), with $22 \%$ geared for residents making more than this amount, and 20\% for residents making less than this amount. ${ }^{11}$

That plan has now been modified and expanded. In "Housing New York 2.0," released in November of 2017, the de Blasio administration outlined a plan to complete the promised 200,000 units of housing two years ahead of schedule, and add another 100,000 units to the goal, for a total of 300,000 affordable units by 2026. The new guidelines call for $55.5 \%$ to be affordable for "lowincome" families making between $51 \%$ and $80 \%$ of Area Median Income (currently \$42,951-\$68,720 for a family of three), with $19.5 \%$ geared toward residents making more than this amount, and $25.0 \%$ for residents making less than this amount. The plan also creates new programs aimed at increasing affordable housing for seniors, preserving MitchellLama housing, and creating more micro units. ${ }^{12}$

As part of Housing New York 2.0, HPD- and HDCsponsored programs spurred a total of 32,303 housing starts ${ }^{8}$ in Fiscal Year (FY) 2018, a 32.3\% increase over the prior FY. Of these starts, 22,976 (71.3\%) were preservation, and 9,227 ( $28.7 \%$ ) were new construction. A total of 25,000 units are targeted for both FY 2019 and FY 2020. ${ }^{9}$ During the first nine months of FY 2019 there were 13,289 starts by HPD and HDC, an increase of $16.2 \%$ over the same period of the prior FY. ${ }^{10}$

Through March of 2019, the de Blasio administration reports it has financed 123,466 units of affordable housing since the start of the Mayor's tenure, 68\% preservation and 32\% new construction. By borough, $30.7 \%$ of the starts were located in Brooklyn, with 29.9\% in the Bronx, 28.3\% in Manhattan, $9.3 \%$ in Queens, and $1.8 \%$ in Staten Island. By affordability level, $16.6 \%$ of the starts were aimed at extremely low-income households, $24.4 \%$ at very low-income households, $42.9 \%$ at low-income households, $5.9 \%$ at moderateincome households, and $10.2 \%$ at middle-income
and higher households. ${ }^{13}$ Almost 18,000 of these units ( $15 \%$ of the total) were dedicated to special needs populations (the homeless and seniors).

## Tax Incentive Programs

The City offers various tax incentive programs to promote the development of new housing. One such program is the 421-a tax exemption program, which began in the early 1970s. While there have been various iterations of the program over the years, all have allowed both renter- and owneroccupied multifamily properties to reduce their taxable assessed value for the duration of the benefit period. That is, owners are exempt from paying additional real estate taxes due to the increased value of the property resulting from the new construction. Rental apartments built with 421-a tax exemptions are subject to the provisions of the Rent Stabilization Laws during the exemption period. Initial rents are required to be approved when obtaining certification by HPD at the completion of construction, and units are then subject to increases established by the NYC Rent Guidelines Board.

A variety of factors are used to establish the level and period of 421-a benefits, and properties are also subject to construction guidelines. Prior to 2016 (under the previous iteration of the 421-a program, which is still newly certifying units in those buildings that started construction prior to this date), eligible buildings received an exemption for 10 to 25 years depending on location, the number of units reserved for low- and moderate-income tenants, and whether they were located in a City-designated neighborhood preservation area. Longer exemption periods applied in northern Manhattan and boroughs outside Manhattan, and to projects that received governmental assistance or contained no fewer than 20\% low-income units. For buildings within the Geographic Exclusion area (all of Manhattan, and parts of each of the other boroughs), affordable housing was required to be contained within the newly constructed building. ${ }^{14}$

After expiring at the end of 2015, the latest iteration of the 421-a program was reinstated in April of 2017 (retroactive to January 1, 2016), with a new
name (Affordable New York Housing Program) and policy changes. Per the Affordable New York Housing Program, rental developments with 300 units or more in Manhattan (south of 96th Street) and the Brooklyn and Queens waterfront will be eligible for a full property tax abatement for 35 years if the development creates one of three options for affordable rental units and meets newly established minimum construction wage requirements. The units must remain affordable for 40 years. For all other rental developments in NYC utilizing the tax benefit, the full tax exemption benefit period is 25 years, with a phasing out of benefits in years 26-35. For developers who use the benefit program to build co-op or condo housing, the building must contain no more than 35 units, be located outside of Manhattan, and have an assessed value of no more than $\$ 65,000$ per unit. The benefit lasts for a total of 20 years, with a full exemption for the first $14 .{ }^{15}$ The governor estimates that the new program, which expires in 2022, will create 2,500 new units of affordable housing a year. ${ }^{16}$

In March of 2017, the NYC Independent Budget Office analyzed the then-proposed Affordable New York Housing Program and estimated that it would cost the City a total of $\$ 8.4$ billion in lost tax revenue

Units Newly Receiving 421-a Certificates, 2002-2018 in Thousands

36\% Increase in Units Newly Issued 421-a Certificates in 2018

over the next ten years, an estimated $\$ 1.2$ billion more than the cost if the now-expired 421-a program continued unchanged. ${ }^{17}$

At the end of construction, buildings receiving 421-a benefits are required to file for a Final Certificate of Eligibility (FCE) with HPD. In 2018, the number of housing units in buildings newly receiving a 421-a FCE increased for the second consecutive year. Newly certified units rose $36.0 \%$ in 2018 , to 28,292 units (see graph on this page), including increases in all of the boroughs. ${ }^{18}$ Newly certified units rose by the greatest proportion in Staten Island, rising from 32 units in 2017 to 579 in 2018. Units newly certified also rose in Brooklyn, by 44.5\%; in Queens, by 42.6\%; in the Bronx, by 21.5\%; and in Manhattan, by 19.3\%.

Citywide, the largest proportion of units newly certified in 2018 were in buildings located in Brooklyn, with $41.9 \%$ of the total units in the City. Manhattan had 31.4\% of these units, Queens had $18.1 \%$, the Bronx had $6.6 \%$, and $2.0 \%$ of units were in Staten Island. Because buildings in Manhattan are so much larger than buildings in the outer boroughs, almost a third of units were in Manhattan, despite having only 64 of the 1,411 buildings ( $5 \%$ ) newly certified for 421-a benefits Citywide. (See Appendices 7 and 8.)

While the overall (both owner- and renteroccupied) number of newly certified 421-a units rose $36.0 \%$ between 2017 and 2018, the number of rental units in this program rose by a greater proportion, $39.2 \%$, than owner units, $18.7 \%$. Newly certified rental units rose in each borough during 2018, including 47.5\% in Brooklyn; 30.5\% in Queens, $30.3 \%$ in Manhattan; 18.9\% in the Bronx; and from zero to 573 units in Staten Island. More than $86 \%$ of newly certified units in 2018 were rental units.

In FY 2019, 204,466 units will benefit from 421-a exemptions and abatements, including 116,000 rental units; 54,000 co-op and condo units; and 34,000 1-3 family and mixed-use structures. It is estimated that the 421-a program will cost the City \$1.6 billion in lost tax revenue for all housing types in FY 2019. ${ }^{19}$

In order to be eligible for tax benefits, properties must register for an FCE with HPD on the
completion of construction. HPD began notifying non-compliant owners in December of 2016 that their benefits would be suspended if they did not apply for an FCE. HPD announced in March of 2018 that it had suspended 421-a benefits, representing $\$ 66$ million in tax revenue for 2018, to 1,788 "properties." The "properties" (individual block and lots comprising approximately 1,300 buildings, including 109 rental buildings with 4,373 units) had received 421-a benefits for at least five years, but had not filed for an FCE. ${ }^{20}$ HPD estimates that approximately $77 \%$ of the properties receiving an FCE in 2017 were due to prior compliance issues, as were $73 \%$ of the properties in 2018. ${ }^{21}$ In February of 2019, an additional 301 buildings were sent notices of non-compliance (including 67 as part of a single complex). ${ }^{22}$

Another program that has offered affordable housing, the New York State Mitchell-Lama program, has suffered from a loss of housing since "buyouts"23 from the program began in 1985. Between 1955 and 1978, approximately 140,000 units of low- and middle-income housing were built in NYC through this tax-break and mortgage subsidy program. Since buyouts began in 1985, the City has lost approximately 48,000 units of MitchellLama housing (including 4,000 units of hospital/university staff housing), although some has transitioned to rent stabilization. After averaging an annual loss of more than 5,000 units between 2004 and 2007, the pace has slowed considerably. Three developments bought out in 2018, with a total of 974 units. All of these developments were rentals, and have plans in place to retain affordability for tenants. ${ }^{24}$ As part of the Housing New York plan, in place since 2014, the City works to preserve the affordability of units in the Mitchell-Lama program (both rentals and co-ops). In FY 2018, 13,137 units were preserved through City efforts, with a total of 29,356 units preserved from the plan's inception through FY 2018. ${ }^{25}$

## Conversions and Subdivisions

Housing units are both gained and lost through subdivisions and conversions. Subdivisions
involve the division of existing residential space into an increased number of units. Non-residential spaces, such as offices or other commercial spaces, can also be converted for residential use, or existing residential spaces can be converted into a smaller number of units by combining units to increase their size. As chronicled in prior Housing Supply Reports, during the mid-2000s, with a tight housing market and high demand for luxury apartments, there were an increasing number of non-residential conversions in neighborhoods Citywide. Conversions occurred in facilities as diverse as hospitals, recording studios, power plants, office buildings, and churches.

One indicator of conversions is the number of non-residential buildings newly receiving J-51 benefits for conversion to residential use. In 2018, for the third consecutive year, no formerly nonresidential buildings received J-51 benefits for conversion to a residential property. ${ }^{26}$

More housing may also be created in the near future through the conversion of basements into legal housing units. A newly passed law, along with modified building codes, establishes a three-year demonstration program to facilitate the creation and alteration of habitable apartments in basements and cellars of certain one- to three-unit homes in Brooklyn's Community District 5 (the East New York and Cypress Hills neighborhoods). The Basement Apartment Conversion Pilot Program provides homeowners in this District, earning less than 165\% of Area Median Income (AMI), with financial and technical assistance to convert their basements into residential units for rental occupancy. Eligible homeowners are provided with financial assistance in the form of a low- or no-interest loan, with a maximum loan amount of $\$ 120,000$, and the technical assistance necessary for completing the construction project. In addition to creating more rental units in this District, the pilot program will also allow the City to more easily facilitate this type of conversion program in the future in other neighborhoods. ${ }^{27}$

Units can also be lost through conversion. Real estate listing site StreetEasy examined Certificate of Occupancy data from the NYC Department of Buildings from 2015-2018 to determine how many
units have been lost due to the conversion of multifamily residential buildings into single-family homes or into a smaller number of units than were present during initial construction. The report found 1,241 buildings across the City that had lost units during this time period and highlights the five neighborhoods with the largest number of buildings that lost units - Central Harlem, the Upper West Side, the Upper East Side, Park Slope, and BedfordStuyvesant. These five neighborhoods had a total of 397 buildings with a decrease in units between 2015 and 2018, with a net loss of 2,056 units. ${ }^{28}$

## SRO Housing and Airbnb Rentals

Conversion of single room occupancy (SRO) buildings also continued over the past year. SRO owners may convert SRO housing to other uses after obtaining a "Certificate of No Harassment" from HPD. For the third consecutive year, the number of approved certificates fell, from 92 in 2017 to 83 in 2018, a decrease of $9.8 \% .^{29}$

Efforts are also underway to ensure that SROs are used for permanent housing rather than as transient hotels. As of May 1, 2011, laws were newly passed strengthening the City's ability to crack down on housing being used illegally for transient occupancy. Transient occupancy is now clearly defined as stays of fewer than 30 days. ${ }^{30}$ Governor Cuomo signed a bill in October of 2016 that further increased the fine for illegally advertising shortterm rentals to as much as $\$ 7,500 .{ }^{31}$

Between May of 2011 and April of 2019, approximately 16,000 violations were issued to illegal hotel operators (including private apartments, hostels, and SROs). This includes more than 3,000 violations issued between May, 2018 and April, 2019), a decrease from the approximately 3,500 violations over the same time period of the prior year. ${ }^{32}$

The effect in NYC of Airbnb and other shortterm rental companies, which facilitate short-term and vacation rentals worldwide, continues to be studied by various City agencies and interest groups. Two 2018 reports (explored in depth in the 2018 Housing Supply Report) found that Airbnb both removes permanent housing from NYC's housing
stock, and increases rents. ${ }^{33}$ In an effort to curb the influence of companies like Airbnb (and other shortterm rental companies), NYC continues to push for additional legislation and oversight of these companies. A law which was passed last July would require online home-sharing sites to disclose to the Mayor's Office of Special Enforcement, on a monthly basis, all listings within NYC. The data would include the identities and addresses of the hosts, and companies would be subject to a $\$ 1,500$ fine for each listing not disclosed. The law was intended to go into effect in February of this year, but in January a federal judge issued a preliminary injunction of the law on constitutional grounds. ${ }^{34}$

A 2019 report from the School of Urban Planning at McGill University (an update to one of the aforementioned 2018 reports; see Endnote 33) analyzes the effect the short-term rental disclosure regulations (currently blocked) would have on the NYC rental market. ${ }^{35}$ It also analyzes the effect of not having these regulations, as is the case as of the publication of this report.

Starting with a baseline of August 31, 2018 (when the report found that there were $30.6 \%$ more units renting for 120 nights or more as compared to the previous year, or a total of 9,000 such listings), the authors found that without new regulations, over the next year the number of housing units taken off the market would increase by an additional 1,800 units (to 10,800); average daily listings would increase $0.8 \%$, to 57,$300 ; 68 \%$ of listing revenue would be earned from illegal reservations; rent would increase for permanent tenants by an aggregate of $\$ 8.6$ million (with a $\$ 60$ million increase over three years); and commercial operators would manage 18.5\% of all entire-home listings (up from $16.7 \%$ today).

Using San Francisco as a guide (where more stringent regulations went into place in January of 2018), the report predicts that with the new regulations there would be an average daily listing decline of $46 \%$ (to 31,000 ); 8,700 housing units would come back into the permanent market; rental vacancy rates would increase, especially in those neighborhoods most popular on listing websites; rent would decrease by an aggregate of $\$ 19$ million
(and by $\$ 130$ million over three years); and illegal revenue would decrease by $69 \%$.

## Cooperative and Condominium Activity

Developers planning to build new co-op or condo buildings, and owners wishing to convert their rental buildings to co-ops or condos, must file plans with, and receive acceptance from, the New York State Attorney General's Office. In 2018, the Attorney General accepted 289 co-op and condo plans, a 3.6\% increase from the number accepted in 2017. ${ }^{36}$ These 289 plans encompassed 10,784 housing units, 29.0\% more than in 2017 (see graph on this page).

More than two-thirds of all plans, 202, were accepted for buildings located in Brooklyn; 49 were located in Manhattan; 38 plans were accepted for Queens; and no plans were accepted in either the Bronx or Staten Island. The greatest number of units were located in Brooklyn, with 4,674 units accepted during 2018. Manhattan had the second highest number of units, 3,384, and Queens had 2,726. (See Appendices 5 and 6.)

The majority of the plans accepted Citywide in 2018 were for new construction, comprising 235 of 289 plans, and a total of 9,351 of 10,784 units. This is similar to the prior year, when new construction

Newly Accepted Co-op and Condo Units, 2006-2018
Increase of 29\% in Newly Accepted Co-op \& Condo Units

accounted for 228 of the 279 accepted plans. Newly accepted co-op and condo plans also included rehabilitations (with 43 plans and 827 units), and non-eviction conversions (with 11 plans and 606 units). Of all the newly accepted plans in 2018, $94.2 \%$ of the units were in condo plans, and $5.8 \%$ were in co-op plans (see graph on this page).

While the conversion of rental housing into co-op and condo units increases the housing inventory for sale, it simultaneously reduces the total number of housing units for rent. Conversions represented $5.6 \%$ of the total number of units in 2018 co-op and condo plans, a lesser share than the $9.1 \%$ share in 2017, and the smallest proportion since at least 1981 (the first year for which data is available). Because most conversion plans are noneviction plans (including all plans in 2018), only when the original rental tenant moves out, or opts to buy the apartment, does the apartment become owner-occupied and removed from the rental stock.

## Rehabilitation

Another method for adding to, or preserving, the City's residential housing stock is through rehabilitation of older buildings. As buildings age, they must undergo rehabilitation to remain habitable. This is particularly true with NYC's housing stock, where more than $57 \%$ of units are in buildings constructed prior to 1947. ${ }^{37}$ Through tax abatement and exemption programs offered by the City for rehabilitation, units are able to remain in, or be readmitted to, the City's housing stock. The J-51 tax abatement and exemption program is intended to encourage the periodic renovation of NYC's stock of both renter- and owner-occupied housing.

The J-51 tax relief program is similar to the 421-a program in that it requires that rental units be subject to rent stabilization for the duration of the benefits, regardless
of the building's regulation status prior to receiving tax benefits. Rehabilitation activities that are permitted under J-51 regulations are Major Capital Improvements (MCIs); moderate and gut rehabilitation of both government-assisted and privately-financed multiple dwellings (which requires significant improvement to at least one major building-wide system); as well as improvements to co-ops and condos (subject to certain assessment guidelines if the project does not include substantial governmental assistance). While prior iterations of the J-51 program allowed for conversion of lofts and non-residential buildings into multiple dwellings, regulations effective January 1, 2012 allow only for conversions if there is substantial governmental assistance. ${ }^{38}$

In 2018, 29,815 units newly received J-51 benefits, an increase of $30.3 \%$ from the previous year (see graph on this page and Appendix 8). ${ }^{39}$ These units were contained in 529 buildings, a decrease of $50.7 \%$ from 2017 levels. The location of the units newly receiving benefits ranged from 43.7\% located in Queens, to 26.5\% in the Bronx;
23.9\% in Brooklyn; 5.3\% in Manhattan; and 0.6\% in Staten Island. Units newly receiving benefits rose, by double digits, in every borough but Manhattan. Units increased $21.4 \%$ in the Bronx, 53.9\% in Brooklyn, $63.0 \%$ in Queens, and from 38 to 178 units in Staten Island. Units newly receiving J-51 benefits fell $57.4 \%$ in Manhattan. (See Appendices 7 and 8.) The average size of the buildings receiving benefits rose dramatically, from 16.2 units in 2017 to 56.4 units in 2018. In 2018, $32.8 \%$ of the units newly certified for the J-51 program were rentals, as were 44.0\% of the buildings.

In FY 2019, the J-51 tax program will cost the City $\$ 297.9$ million in lost tax revenue for all housing types, including approximately 250,000 rental units, 209,000 owner units, and 2,000 1-3 family and mixed-use structures. ${ }^{40}$

Rehabilitation work is also carried out through HPD's "Alternative Enforcement Program (AEP)," now in its twelfth year of identifying the 200-250 "worst" buildings in the City, based on housing code violations. The most recent group of 250 buildings include 4,600 units of housing, with 8,044 non-

Units Receiving Initial J-51 Benefits, 1996-2018, in Thousands
2018 Saw 30\% Increase in Number of Units Newly Receiving J-51 Benefits


Source: NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development
hazardous A-class violations, 23,732 hazardous Bclass violations, and 5,388 immediately hazardous C-class violations. If building owners in this program do not make repairs to their buildings, the City steps in to do so, and then charges the owners. Through the first eleven rounds of the program, the City discharged 1,946 of 2,387 buildings that entered the program, with a combined total of 26,085 of 30,680 units of housing. ${ }^{41}$

## Tax-Delinquent Property

## In Rem Housing and Anti-Abandonment Strategies

Historically, the City foreclosed on thousands of taxdelinquent residential properties, becoming the owner and manager of these buildings, known as in rem properties. By its peak in 1986, the City owned and managed 4,000 occupied buildings containing 40,000 units of housing and almost 6,000 vacant buildings containing 55,000 units of housing.

HPD's Alternative Management Programs began in 1994 with the goal of returning Cityowned properties to private owners and reducing its share of in rem buildings by identifying buildings at risk and helping owners. HPD has successfully reduced the number of occupied and vacant in rem units in HPD central management to 323 through June of 2018, a 99.3\% decline since FY 1994.42 Key initiatives to prevent abandonment include tax lien sales; the Third Party Transfer Program, which targets distressed and other buildings with tax arrears; ${ }^{43}$ and housing education courses, which teach owners and superintendents basic management, maintenance, and finance skills to improve their properties. ${ }^{44}$

The City no longer forecloses and takes title to properties that are tax delinquent or in arrears for water and sewer charges. Instead, tax liens for properties that are not distressed are sold in bulk to private investors after notice is given to property owners, who are given 90 days to pay the arrears. After the lien is sold, the lien holder is entitled to collect the entire lien amount, plus other interest and charges, from the property owner. In addition,
the property owner must continue to pay current taxes to the City. If the owner has not paid the lien or entered into a payment plan, the lien holder can file for foreclosure on the property. ${ }^{45}$ The Lien Sale Task Force, a task force authorized by law to review and evaluate the Lien Sale Program, reported in September of 2016 that between 2008 and 2016, an average of 25,100 properties were added to the lien sale list annually. But the number of liens actually sold was an annual average of 4,600 , or $18.3 \%$ of the liens published on this list. Of the 41,400 liens sold during this period, just 354 ( $0.8 \%$ ) ultimately went into foreclosure, with less than half of these foreclosed properties being residential. ${ }^{46}$

An additional facet of the City's antiabandonment strategy is third party transfer. For buildings that are distressed and in tax arrears, the City can initiate an in rem tax foreclosure action against property owners. The policy, authorized under Local Law 37 of 1996, transfers the title of in rem properties directly to new owners (qualified third parties) without the City ever taking title itself. ${ }^{47}$ Since it began in 1996, the NYC Department of Finance has collected at least $\$ 536$ million in revenue associated with properties in this program, and 530 buildings have been transferred to for-profit and non-profit owners. No new properties have been transferred since 2013, although Round 10 of this program has identified 139 buildings (comprising 2,132 units) which will be transferred in the near future. ${ }^{48}$

## Demolitions

A total of 1,888 buildings were demolished in 2018, a $9.6 \%$ increase over the prior year, following a decrease of $6.9 \%$ in 2017. Brooklyn accounted for $35.0 \%$ of all the buildings demolished in 2018, Queens had $33.1 \%$, Staten Island had $14.1 \%$, the Bronx had 10.1\%, and Manhattan had the lowest proportion, $7.7 \%$. Demolitions rose in every borough but Staten Island, where they fell by $16.6 \%$. Demolitions rose by the greatest proportion in the Bronx, rising 39.7\%, while they rose $28.1 \%$ in Manhattan, 15.4\% in Brooklyn, and $7.8 \%$ in Queens. ${ }^{49}$ (See Appendix 9.)

Obtaining a permit for demolition or significant alterations may be harder going forward. A three-year pilot program, which started in the Fall of 2018, requires certain owners to obtain a"Certificate of No Harassment" (CONH) before Department of Buildings approval of demolition or significant alteration permits. Among the buildings that will need this approval are those in which either a court or New York State Homes and Community Renewal found at least one case of harassment since September of 2013; distressed buildings in one of 11 Community Districts; buildings that have been the subject of a full vacate order; or those buildings that participated in the AEP program for at least four months since February 1, 2016. Following a hearing to determine whether harassment of tenants has taken place within the previous 60 months, those buildings found not eligible for a CONH have the choice of entering into a "cure agreement," where affordable housing is developed within the Community District in exchange for the permit. Absent a cure agreement, no permits will be issued to those buildings who fail to obtain a CONH for at least 60 months following the denial. ${ }^{50}$ In October of 2018, the City published a list of buildings subject to the new regulations, including more than 1,000 buildings and 26,000 units of housing. ${ }^{51}$

## Summary

In 2018, housing permits fell, decreasing by 5.5\%, while the number of completed housing units increased by $4.5 \%$. The number of units newly receiving 421-a tax benefits rose $36.0 \%$ in 2018, while units newly receiving J-51 tax abatements and exemptions increased by $30.3 \%$. There was an increase in newly accepted co-op and condo units, with units increasing $29.0 \%$ and plans increasing by $3.6 \%$. Rental housing availability remains tight, with a Citywide vacancy rate of $3.63 \%$ in 2017 , and more than $11 \%$ of rental units overcrowded. Mayor de Blasio's expanded housing initiative calls for the development and preservation of 300,000 units of housing by 2026 , more than 123,000 of which have already been started, to help reduce the affordable housing shortage.

## Endnotes

1. The NYC Housing and Vacancy Survey is conducted triennially, sponsored by the NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) and conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau. Data is based on "Selected Initial Findings of the 2017 NYC Housing and Vacancy Survey," prepared by HPD.
2. The U.S. housing stock was comprised of $36.1 \%$ renter-occupied units, according to the 2017 American Community Survey, conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau. To calculate the ratio of renter-occupied units in NYC, staff did not include vacant units that are not for sale or for rent in the total number of housing units.
3. Other units include public housing, Mitchell-Lama, In Rem, HUDregulated, Article 4 and Loft Board units.
4. Since the number of vacant units available for rent in Staten Island is small, and the HVS is a sample survey, the sampling error of the vacancy rate is likely to be large, and thus, the U.S. Census Bureau could not calculate an accurate vacancy rate.
5. U.S. Census Bureau website: https://www.census.gov/construction/bps/.
6. NYC Department of City Planning Housing Database 19v1, compilation of NYC Department of Buildings Applications and Certificates of Occupancy data. Note that the data is continually updated and is subject to change, including data from prior years.
7. Beginning with the 2006 Housing Supply Report, the NYC Department of City Planning (DCP) defines a housing completion as any unit receiving either a final or a temporary Certificate of Occupancy in the stated year. DCP provided this information for the 2004 calendar year and beyond, and believes it is a more accurate representation of new housing in NYC than previous methodologies which only counted final Certificates of Occupancy.
8. Starts refer to the number of units beginning construction or rehabilitation in a given period.
9. Preliminary Fiscal 2019 Mayor's Management Report: http://www1.nyc.gov/site/operations/performance/mmr.page.
10. Housing New York By the Numbers website: http://www1.nyc.gov/ site/housing/action/by-the-numbers.page; accessed April 2019, with data through 3/31/2019.
11. "Housing New York: A Five-Borough, Ten-Year Plan," NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, May 5, 2014.
12. "Housing New York 2.0," NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, November 15, 2017.
13. Housing New York By the Numbers website: http://www1.nyc.gov/ site/housing/action/by-the-numbers.page; accessed April 2019, with data through 3/31/2019. Per "Housing New York 2.0" Extremely LowIncome is defined as 0-30\% of Area Median Income (AMI); Very LowIncome: 31-50\% of AMI; Low-Income: 51-80\% of AMI; ModerateIncome: 81-120\% of AMI; Middle-Income: 121-165\% of AMI.
14. Program information available at: http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/ developers/tax-incentives-421a.page.
15. Program information available at: https://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/ developers/tax-incentives-421a-main.page.
16. "Governor Cuomo and Legislative Leaders Announce Agreement on FY 2018 State Budget," State of New York Press Release, April 7, 2017.
17. "Estimated Cost to New York City of Governor Cuomo's Proposed Affordable New York Housing Program," NYC Independent Budget Office, March, 2017.
18. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Tax Incentives Program data. A large part of the increase in newly issued Final Certificates of Eligibility (FCE) in 2018 is due to enforcement policies by HPD, requiring owners to file for FCEs or lose their tax benefits.
19. "Annual Report on Tax Expenditures," NYC Department of Finance, February, 2019.
20. "City Suspends 421-a Benefits to More Than 1,700 Non-Compliant Owners." HPD Press Release. March 9, 2018. Note that the 1,788 properties include condo buildings, with each unit within the building having an individual block and lot designation.
21. This information was provided to the RGB by the New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development at the same time it provided tax incentives data for 2018 (April, 2019). See Endnote 18.
22. NYC Department of Finance website; https://www1.nyc.gov/ site/finance/benefits/benefits-421a.page; accessed April, 2019.
23. Developments are eligible to withdraw from the Mitchell-Lama program (buyout), after 20 years upon prepayment of the mortgage (or after 35 years in the case of developments aided by loans prior to May 1, 1959).
24. The number of Mitchell-Lama buyouts was provided most recently through the NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development and the NYS Homes and Community Renewal, and in previous years through other sources, such as the report "Affordable No More: An Update" by the Office of the New York City Comptroller, Office of Policy Management on May 25, 2006. Two of the developments that bought out in 2018 will remain affordable through Article 11, while the other will convert to a co-op, with present tenants able to purchase their apartments at $30 \%$ below market, or remain renters with rent adjustments following RGB guidelines.
25. "Your Key to NYC: Mayor de Blasio Announces Largest Year for Affordable Housing Production in City's History." Mayor's Office Press Release, July 19, 2018.
26. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Tax Incentives Program data.
27. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development website; https://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/developers/development-programs/basement-conversion.page; accessed April, 2019.
28. "NYC's Disappearing Homes: When Updated Buildings Mean Fewer Units," StreetEasy, April 1, 2019; https://streeteasy.com/ blog/nyc-disappearing-homes/.
29. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development.
30. Mayor Bloomberg Announces Results of City's Efforts to Curb Dangerous Illegal Hotels in New York City After State Legislation Enhances Enforcement Abilities." Mayor's Office Press Release 157-12, April 27, 2012.
31. "Cuomo signs bill that deals huge blow to Airbnb," New York Post, October 21, 2016.
32. Office of the Criminal Justice Coordinator, Mayor's Office of Special Enforcement. Complete April 2019 data was not yet finalized as of the publication of this report. Inclusive of data through approximately April 23, 2019.
33. See the 2018 Housing Supply Report for more information on the following two reports: "The High Cost of Short-Term Rentals in New by York City," by David Wachsmuth, David Chaney, Danielle Kerrigan, Andrea Shillolo, and Robin Basalaev-Binder (McGill University), January 30, 2018 and "The Impact of Airbnb on NYC Rents," NYC Comptroller's Office, April 2018.
34. "Judge Blocks New York City Law Aimed at Curbing Airbnb Rental," New York Times, January 3, 2019.
35. "The Impact of New Short-term Rental Regulations on New York City," by David Wachsmuth Jennifer Combs and Danielle Kerrigan (McGill University), January, 2019.
36. NYS Attorney General's Office, Real Estate Financing Bureau data and the NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Sales Unit. Virtually all accepted units reported are from data provided by the NYS Attorney General. For the purposes of this report, "accepted" refers only to those co-op and condo plans that require offering plans. Those that do not, and receive a "noaction" letter from the NYS Attorney General's office, are not included in this data.
37. 2017 NYC Housing and Vacancy Survey, U.S. Census Bureau.
38. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development website; http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/developers/tax-incentivesj51.page.
39. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Tax Incentives Program data. Note that, similar to the 421-a program, $\mathrm{J}-51$ provides tax abatements and incentives to both renter- and owner-occupied units.
40. "Annual Report on Tax Expenditures," NYC Department of Finance publication, February, 2019.
41. "HPD Announces Enforcement Action Against 250 Troubled Buildings." HPD Press Release, February 5, 2019.
42. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development.
43. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development website; http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/owners/compliance-property-tax-delinquency.page.
44. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development website; http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/community/outreach-andeducation.page.
45. NYC Department of Finance, General Information on the City's Tax Lien Sale Process; http://www1.nyc.gov/site/finance/taxes/ property-lien-sales.page.
46. "Report of the Lien Sale Task Force," September 2016.
47. "New York City Case Study: Third Party Transfer Initiative: A Solution To Property Abandonment," by Lisa Mueller, Local Initiative Support Corporation report, January 14, 2003.
48. Most recent figures obtained from NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, April, 2019.
49. NYC Department of Buildings (DOB) data. Note that demolition statistics include both residential as well as commercial buildings, as the DOB does not specify the type of building in its data.
50. City of New York Local Law 1 of 2018.
51. "City Targets Over 1,000 Buildings for New Tenant Protection Program." HPD Press Release, October 12, 2018.

## Appendices

1. Permits Issued For Housing Units in New York City, 1961-2018

| Year | Bronx | Brooklyn | Manhattan | Queens | Staten Island | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1961 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 70,606 |
| 1962 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 70,686 |
| 1963 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 49,898 |
| 1964 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 20,594 |
| 1965 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 25,715 |
| 1966 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 23,142 |
| 1967 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 22,174 |
| 1968 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 22,062 |
| 1969 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 17,031 |
| 1970 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 22,365 |
| 1971 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 32,254 |
| 1972 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 36,061 |
| 1973 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 22,417 |
| 1974 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 15,743 |
| 1975 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 3,810 |
| 1976 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 5,435 |
| 1977 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 7,639 |
| 1978 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 11,096 |
| 1979 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 14,524 |
| 1980 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 7,800 |
| 1981 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 11,060 |
| 1982 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 7,649 |
| 1983 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 11,795 |
| 1984 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 11,566 |
| 1985 | 1,263 | 1,068 | 12,079 | 2,211 | 3,711 | 20,332 |
| 1986 | 920 | 1,278 | 1,622 | 2,180 | 3,782 | 9,782 |
| 1987 | 931 | 1,650 | 3,811 | 3,182 | 4,190 | 13,764 |
| 1988 | 967 | 1,629 | 2,460 | 2,506 | 2,335 | 9,897 |
| 1989 | 1,643 | 1,775 | 2,986 | 2,339 | 2,803 | 11,546 |
| 1990 | 1,182 | 1,634 | 2,398 | 704 | 940 | 6,858 |
| 1991 | 1,093 | 1,024 | 756 | 602 | 1,224 | 4,699 |
| 1992 | 1,257 | 646 | 373 | 351 | 1,255 | 3,882 |
| 1993 | 1,293 | 1,015 | 1,150 | 530 | 1,185 | 5,173 |
| 1994 | 846 | 911 | 428 | 560 | 1,265 | 4,010 |
| 1995 | 853 | 943 | 1,129 | 738 | 1,472 | 5,135 |
| 1996 | 885 | 942 | 3,369 | 1,301 | 2,155 | 8,652 |
| 1997 | 1,161 | 1,063 | 3,762 | 1,144 | 1,857 | 8,987 |
| 1998 | 1,309 | 1,787 | 3,823 | 1,446 | 2,022 | 10,387 |
| 1999 | 1,153 | 2,894 | 3,791 | 2,169 | 2,414 | 12,421 |
| 2000 | 1,646 | 2,904 | 5,110 | 2,723 | 2,667 | 15,050 |
| 2001 | 2,216 | 2,973 | 6,109 | 3,264 | 2,294 | 16,856 |
| 2002 | 2,626 | 5,247 | 5,407 | 3,464 | 1,756 | 18,500 |
| 2003 | 2,935 | 6,054 | 5,232 | 4,399 | 2,598 | 21,218 |
| 2004 | 4,924 | 6,825 | 4,555 | 6,853 | 2,051 | 25,208 |
| 2005 | 4,937 | 9,028 | 8,493 | 7,269 | 1,872 | 31,599 |
| 2006 | 4,658 | 9,191 | 8,790 | 7,252 | 1,036 | 30,927 |
| 2007 | 3,088 | 10,930 | 9,520 | 7,625 | 739 | 31,902 |
| 2008 | 2,482 | 12,744 | 9,700 | 7,730 | 1,255 | 33,911 |
| 2009 | 1,647 | 1,003 | 1,363 | 1,474 | 570 | 6,057 |
| 2010 | 1,064 | 2,093 | 704 | 2,358 | 508 | 6,727 |
| 2011 | 1,116 | 1,522 | 2,535 | 3,182 | 581 | 8,936 |
| 2012 | 2,552 | 3,353 | 2,328 | 1,428 | 673 | 10,334 |
| 2013 | 2,638 | 6,140 | 4,856 | 3,161 | 1,200 | 17,995 |
| 2014 | 1,885 | 7,551 | 5,435 | 4,900 | 712 | 20,483 |
| 2015 | 4,682 | 26,026 | 12,612 | 12,667 | 541 | 56,528 |
| 2016 | 4,003 | 4,503 | 4,024 | 2,838 | 901 | 16,269 |
| 2017 | 5,401 | 6,130 | 4,811 | 5,104 | 685 | 22,131 |
| 2018 | 3,698 | 8,445 | 3,584 | 4,577 | 606 | 20,910 |

Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, Manufacturing and Construction Division, Building Permits Branch

## 2. Permits Issued by Building Size \& Borough (In Percentages), 2010-2018

| Year/Borough | 1-Family | 2-Family | 3/4 Family | 5 or More-Family | Total Buildings |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2010 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 9.2\% | 38.5\% | 23.1\% | 29.2\% | 65 |
| Brooklyn | 3.6\% | 31.4\% | 27.9\% | 37.1\% | 140 |
| Manhattan | 0.0\% | 18.2\% | 9.1\% | 72.7\% | 11 |
| Queens | 12.4\% | 67.2\% | 11.2\% | 9.2\% | 509 |
| Staten Island | 71.9\% | 27.2\% | 0.6\% | 0.3\% | 349 |
| Citywide | 30.3\% | 47.3\% | 10.6\% | 11.8\% | 1,074 |
| 2011 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 1.5\% | 35.3\% | 19.1\% | 44.1\% | 68 |
| Brooklyn | 0.0\% | 44.3\% | 30.5\% | 25.3\% | 174 |
| Manhattan | 3.6\% | 0.0\% | 3.6\% | 92.9\% | 28 |
| Queens | 21.5\% | 57.0\% | 11.9\% | 9.6\% | 386 |
| Staten Island | 52.5\% | 47.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.3\% | 341 |
| Citywide | 26.5\% | 48.3\% | 11.3\% | 13.8\% | 997 |
| 2012 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 5.9\% | 39.3\% | 17.0\% | 37.8\% | 135 |
| Brooklyn | 0.4\% | 20.5\% | 36.9\% | 42.2\% | 249 |
| Manhattan | 9.5\% | 4.8\% | 0.0\% | 85.7\% | 42 |
| Queens | 26.8\% | 41.9\% | 16.9\% | 14.4\% | 284 |
| Staten Island | 64.1\% | 34.6\% | 0.0\% | 1.3\% | 298 |
| Citywide | 27.8\% | 32.5\% | 16.2\% | 23.5\% | 1,008 |
| 2013 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 2.4\% | 41.6\% | 12.0\% | 44.0\% | 125 |
| Brooklyn | 0.0\% | 19.8\% | 31.6\% | 48.6\% | 364 |
| Manhattan | 1.6\% | 7.8\% | 0.0\% | 90.6\% | 64 |
| Queens | 39.3\% | 32.6\% | 13.3\% | 14.8\% | 399 |
| Staten Island | 55.9\% | 42.5\% | 0.2\% | 1.4\% | 431 |
| Citywide | 29.1\% | 32.0\% | 13.3\% | 25.7\% | 1,383 |
| 2014 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 0.0\% | 33.3\% | 20.4\% | 46.3\% | 108 |
| Brooklyn | 0.0\% | 19.3\% | 25.8\% | 55.0\% | 400 |
| Manhattan | 1.3\% | 9.0\% | 2.6\% | 87.2\% | 78 |
| Queens | 47.8\% | 25.4\% | 10.5\% | 16.3\% | 448 |
| Staten Island | 68.1\% | 31.1\% | 0.2\% | 0.6\% | 479 |
| Citywide | 35.8\% | 25.3\% | 11.6\% | 27.4\% | 1,513 |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 2.9\% | 26.3\% | 9.5\% | 61.3\% | 137 |
| Brooklyn | 5.3\% | 7.0\% | 14.7\% | 73.0\% | 812 |
| Manhattan | 3.8\% | 1.9\% | 2.9\% | 91.4\% | 105 |
| Queens | 31.0\% | 26.3\% | 11.6\% | 31.2\% | 552 |
| Staten Island | 63.0\% | 36.7\% | 0.0\% | 0.3\% | 392 |
| Citywide | 23.5\% | 19.2\% | 10.0\% | 47.3\% | 1,998 |
| 2016 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 1.8\% | 25.2\% | 17.1\% | 55.9\% | 111 |
| Brooklyn | 30.6\% | 14.6\% | 14.0\% | 40.9\% | 487 |
| Manhattan | 6.3\% | 3.2\% | 3.2\% | 87.3\% | 63 |
| Queens | 39.8\% | 38.4\% | 10.3\% | 11.5\% | 477 |
| Staten Island | 52.2\% | 46.4\% | 0.0\% | 1.4\% | 414 |
| Citywide | 36.1\% | 30.7\% | 8.9\% | 24.3\% | 1,552 |
| 2017 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 6.4\% | 22.1\% | 13.6\% | 57.9\% | 140 |
| Brooklyn | 16.7\% | 17.1\% | 13.2\% | 53.0\% | 491 |
| Manhattan | 5.3\% | 6.6\% | 3.9\% | 84.2\% | 76 |
| Queens | 23.1\% | 43.5\% | 15.7\% | 17.8\% | 490 |
| Staten Island | 57.8\% | 41.6\% | 0.4\% | 0.2\% | 476 |
| Citywide | 28.9\% | 31.7\% | 9.9\% | 29.5\% | 1,673 |
| 2018 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 5.6\% | 21.0\% | 6.5\% | 66.9\% | 124 |
| Brooklyn | 11.0\% | 10.6\% | 17.7\% | 60.7\% | 453 |
| Manhattan | 0.0\% | 5.1\% | 0.0\% | 94.9\% | 59 |
| Queens | 30.4\% | 39.1\% | 10.7\% | 19.7\% | 391 |
| Staten Island | 57.5\% | 42.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.5\% | 419 |
| Citywide | 28.8\% | 28.1\% | 9.0\% | 34.1\% | 1,446 |

Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, Manufacturing and Construction Division, Building Permits Branch

## 3. Permits Issued For Housing Units by Quarter, 2008-2019

| Year | Bronx | Brooklyn | Manhattan | Queens | Staten Island | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 862 | 1,603 | 485 | 705 | 238 | 3,893 |
| Q2 | 701 | 8,970 | 7,623 | 5,497 | 546 | 23,337 |
| Q3 | 695 | 1,520 | 880 | 1,016 | 397 | 4,508 |
| Q4 | 224 | 651 | 712 | 512 | 74 | 2,173 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 164 | 137 | 151 | 508 | 117 | 1,077 |
| Q2 | 130 | 511 | 716 | 353 | 233 | 1,943 |
| Q3 | 497 | 243 | 336 | 331 | 144 | 1,551 |
| Q4 | 856 | 112 | 160 | 282 | 76 | 1,486 |
| 2010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 56 | 175 | 326 | 249 | 199 | 1,005 |
| Q2 | 490 | 867 | 166 | 612 | 121 | 2,256 |
| Q3 | 231 | 246 | 176 | 394 | 83 | 1,130 |
| Q4 | 287 | 805 | 36 | 1,103 | 105 | 2,336 |
| 2011 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 205 | 291 | 146 | 411 | 88 | 1,141 |
| Q2 | 508 | 624 | 1,199 | 1,416 | 228 | 3,975 |
| Q3 | 248 | 303 | 391 | 459 | 178 | 1,579 |
| Q4 | 155 | 304 | 799 | 896 | 87 | 2,241 |
| 2012 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 564 | 600 | 556 | 197 | 193 | 2,110 |
| Q2 | 619 | 310 | 1,041 | 643 | 134 | 2,747 |
| Q3 | 409 | 1,496 | 421 | 378 | 142 | 2,846 |
| Q4 | 960 | 947 | 310 | 210 | 204 | 2,631 |
| 2013 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 214 | 1,184 | 568 | 428 | 162 | 2,556 |
| Q2 | 1,066 | 1,117 | 1,162 | 730 | 689 | 4,764 |
| Q3 | 336 | 1,918 | 1,708 | 1,006 | 172 | 5,140 |
| Q4 | 1,022 | 1,921 | 1,418 | 997 | 177 | 5,535 |
| 2014 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 379 | 1,725 | 1,809 | 1,067 | 121 | 5,101 |
| Q2 | 583 | 1,617 | 1,041 | 1,471 | 140 | 4,852 |
| Q3 | 736 | 2,675 | 1,506 | 812 | 207 | 5,936 |
| Q4 | 187 | 1,534 | 1,079 | 1,550 | 244 | 4,594 |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 561 | 3,574 | 1,154 | 782 | 112 | 6,183 |
| Q2 | 1,269 | 15,453 | 9,760 | 9,182 | 151 | 35,815 |
| Q3 | 1,651 | 1,163 | 1,057 | 250 | 175 | 4,296 |
| Q4 | 1,201 | 5,836 | 641 | 2,453 | 103 | 10,234 |
| 2016 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 866 | 482 | 297 | 368 | 145 | 2,158 |
| Q2 | 1,060 | 912 | 506 | 854 | 476 | 3,808 |
| Q3 | 764 | 1,666 | 1,776 | 931 | 145 | 5,282 |
| Q4 | 1,313 | 1,443 | 1,445 | 685 | 135 | 5,021 |
| 2017 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 1,124 | 2,097 | 1,486 | 1,434 | 202 | 6,343 |
| Q2 | 1,267 | 1,454 | 1,004 | 1,801 | 154 | 5,680 |
| Q3 | 1,050 | 1,000 | 1,183 | 1,033 | 170 | 4,436 |
| Q4 | 1,960 | 1,579 | 1,138 | 836 | 159 | 5,672 |
| 2018 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 1,181 | 1,737 | 1,326 | 794 | 132 | 5,170 |
| Q2 | 1,403 | 1,768 | 673 | 1,465 | 167 | 5,476 |
| Q3 | 562 | 2,346 | 647 | 735 | 171 | 4,461 |
| Q4 | 552 | 2,594 | 938 | 1,583 | 136 | 5,803 |
| 2019 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 839 | 2,271 | 1,037 | 2,010 | 172 | 6,329 |

Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, Manufacturing and Construction Division, Building Permits Branch

## 4. New Housing Units Completed in New York City, 1963-2018

| Year | Bronx | Brooklyn | Manhattan | Queens | Staten Island | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1963 | 8,780 | 12,264 | 19,398 | 17,166 | 2,423 | 60,031 |
| 1964 | 9,503 | 13,555 | 15,833 | 10,846 | 2,182 | 51,919 |
| 1965 | 6,247 | 10,084 | 14,699 | 16,103 | 2,319 | 49,452 |
| 1966 | 7,174 | 6,926 | 8,854 | 6,935 | 2,242 | 32,131 |
| 1967 | 4,038 | 3,195 | 7,108 | 5,626 | 3,069 | 23,036 |
| 1968 | 3,138 | 4,158 | 2,707 | 4,209 | 3,030 | 17,242 |
| 1969 | 1,313 | 2,371 | 6,570 | 3,447 | 3,768 | 17,469 |
| 1970 | 1,652 | 1,695 | 3,155 | 4,230 | 3,602 | 14,334 |
| 1971 | 7,169 | 2,102 | 4,708 | 2,576 | 2,909 | 19,464 |
| 1972 | 11,923 | 2,593 | 1,931 | 3,021 | 3,199 | 22,667 |
| 1973 | 6,294 | 4,340 | 2,918 | 3,415 | 3,969 | 20,936 |
| 1974 | 3,380 | 4,379 | 6,418 | 3,406 | 2,756 | 20,339 |
| 1975 | 4,469 | 3,084 | 9,171 | 2,146 | 2,524 | 21,394 |
| 1976 | 1,373 | 10,782 | 6,760 | 3,364 | 1,638 | 23,917 |
| 1977 | 721 | 3,621 | 2,547 | 1,350 | 1,984 | 10,223 |
| 1978 | 464 | 345 | 3,845 | 697 | 1,717 | 7,068 |
| 1979 | 405 | 1,566 | 4,060 | 1,042 | 2,642 | 9,715 |
| 1980 | 1,709 | 708 | 3,306 | 783 | 2,380 | 8,886 |
| 1981 | 396 | 454 | 4,416 | 1,152 | 2,316 | 8,734 |
| 1982 | 997 | 332 | 1,812 | 2,451 | 1,657 | 7,249 |
| 1983 | 757 | 1,526 | 2,558 | 2,926 | 1,254 | 9,021 |
| 1984 | 242 | 1,975 | 3,500 | 2,291 | 2,277 | 10,285 |
| 1985 | 557 | 1,301 | 1,739 | 1,871 | 1,939 | 7,407 |
| 1986 | 968 | 2,398 | 4,266 | 1,776 | 2,715 | 12,123 |
| 1987 | 1,177 | 1,735 | 4,197 | 2,347 | 3,301 | 12,757 |
| 1988 | 1,248 | 1,631 | 5,548 | 2,100 | 2,693 | 13,220 |
| 1989 | 847 | 2,098 | 5,979 | 3,560 | 2,201 | 14,685 |
| 1990 | 872 | 929 | 7,260 | 2,327 | 1,384 | 12,772 |
| 1991 | 656 | 764 | 2,608 | 1,956 | 1,627 | 7,611 |
| 1992 | 802 | 1,337 | 3,750 | 1,498 | 1,136 | 8,523 |
| 1993 | 886 | 616 | 1,810 | 801 | 1,466 | 5,579 |
| 1994 | 891 | 1,035 | 1,927 | 1,527 | 1,573 | 6,953 |
| 1995 | 1,166 | 1,647 | 2,798 | 1,013 | 1,268 | 7,892 |
| 1996 | 1,075 | 1,583 | 1,582 | 1,152 | 1,726 | 7,118 |
| 1997 | 1,391 | 1,369 | 816 | 1,578 | 1,791 | 6,945 |
| 1998 | 575 | 1,333 | 5,175 | 1,263 | 1,751 | 10,097 |
| 1999 | 1,228 | 1,025 | 2,341 | 2,119 | 2,264 | 8,977 |
| 2000 | 1,385 | 1,353 | 6,064 | 2,096 | 1,896 | 12,794 |
| 2001 | 1,617 | 2,404 | 6,036 | 1,225 | 2,198 | 13,480 |
| 2002 | 1,220 | 2,248 | 8,326 | 1,981 | 2,453 | 16,228 |
| 2003 | 1,473 | 2,575 | 3,798 | 2,344 | 2,589 | 12,779 |
| 2004* | 3,326 | 4,512 | 6,150 | 3,087 | 2,291 | 19,366 |
| 2005* | 3,012 | 5,007 | 5,006 | 4,526 | 1,942 | 19,493 |
| 2006* | 4,311 | 6,418 | 5,199 | 5,940 | 1,900 | 23,768 |
| 2007* | 4,422 | 7,109 | 7,498 | 5,907 | 1,446 | 26,382 |
| 2008* | 4,217 | 7,254 | 6,118 | 5,437 | 1,019 | 24,045 |
| 2009* | 2,964 | 7,522 | 8,110 | 4,969 | 887 | 24,452 |
| 2010* | 3,948 | 7,181 | 7,801 | 4,401 | 714 | 24,045 |
| 2011* | 3,417 | 4,728 | 2,375 | 2,852 | 612 | 13,984 |
| 2012* | 1,413 | 3,611 | 1,159 | 2,632 | 640 | 9,455 |
| 2013* | 1,272 | 3,948 | 3,126 | 3,854 | 482 | 12,682 |
| 2014* | 1,660 | 4,485 | 2,231 | 2,961 | 530 | 11,867 |
| 2015* | 2,396 | 5,324 | 2,986 | 3,110 | 541 | 14,357 |
| 2016* | 2,532 | 9,148 | 6,900 | 3,444 | 1,223 | 23,247 |
| 2017* | 2,672 | 11,065 | 6,390 | 5,041 | 671 | 25,839 |
| 2018* | 4,761 | 9,378 | 5,672 | 6,318 | 863 | 26,992 |

Note: Housing unit count is based on the number of Certificates of Occupancy issued by NYC Department of Buildings (DOB), or equivalent action by the Empire State Development Corporation or NYS Dormitory Authority. Prior years' data may be adjusted and may not match prior reports.
*Data from 2004-2018 now includes Final Certificates of Occupancy (as with all other years) as well as Temporary Certificates of Occupancy data for the first time. Data will be updated every year to reflect the most current estimates.

Source: NYC Department of City Planning, Housing Database 19v1, compilation of NYC DOB Applications and Certificates of Occupancy data

## 5. Number of Residential Co-op and Condo Plans Accepted for Filing By the NYS Attorney General's Office, 2013-2018

|  | $2013$ <br> Plans (Units) | $2014$ <br> Plans (Units) | $2015$ <br> Plans (Units) | $2016$ <br> Plans (Units) | $2017$ <br> Plans (Units) | $2018$ <br> Plans (Units) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Private Plans |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| New Construction | 150 (3,658) | $211(5,171)$ | $219(8,880)$ | $210(6,653)$ | $228(6,906)$ | 235 (9,351) |
| Rehabilitation | 21 (649) | 37 (462) | 43 (607) | 45 (416) | 33 (688) | 42 (815) |
| Conversion (Non-Eviction) | 16 (819) | $20(3,956)$ | $28(3,065)$ | $27(1,602)$ | 18 (764) | 11 (606) |
| Conversion (Eviction) Private Total | $\begin{gathered} 0 \\ 187(5,126) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0 \\ 268(9,589) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0 \\ 290(12,552) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0 \\ 282(8,671) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0 \\ 279 \text { (8.358) } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0 \\ 288(10,772) \end{gathered}$ |
|  | Plans (Units) | Plans (Units) | Plans (Units) | Plans (Units) | Plans (Units) | Plans (Units) |
| HPD Sponsored Plans |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| New Construction | 1 (95) | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Rehabilitation | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 (12) |
| Conversion (Non-Eviction) | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Conversion (Eviction) | 0 | 0 | 1 (70) | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| HPD Total | 1 (95) | 0 | 1 (70) | 0 | 0 | 1 (12) |
| Grand Total | $188(5,221)$ | $268(9,589)$ | $291(12,622)$ | 282 (8,671) | $279(8,358)$ | 289 (10,784) |

Note: Figures exclude "Homeowner," "No Action," and "Commercial" plans/units.
Source: New York State Attorney General's Office, Real Estate Financing Bureau

## 6. Number of Units in Co-op and Condo Plans Accepted for Filing By the NYS Attorney General's Office, 1990-2018

| Year | New <br> Construction | Conversion Eviction | Conversion Non-Eviction | Rehabilitation | New Construction Conversion \& Rehab | Units in HPD Sponsored Plans |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1990 | 4,203 | 364 | 14,640 | -- | 19,207 | 1,175 |
| 1991 | 1,111 | 173 | 1,757 | -- | 3,041 | 2,459 |
| 1992 | 793 | 0 | 566 | -- | 1,359 | 1,674 |
| 1993 | 775 | 41 | 134 | -- | 950 | 455 |
| 1994 | 393 | 283 | 176 | 807 | 1,659 | 901 |
| 1995 | 614 | 426 | 201 | 1,258 | 2,499 | 935 |
| 1996 | 83 | 16 | 196 | 284 | 579 | 0 |
| 1997 | 1,417 | 38 | 131 | 852 | 2,438 | 533 |
| 1998 | 3,225 | 0 | 386 | 826 | 4,437 | 190 |
| 1999 | 1,123 | 343 | 359 | 1,029 | 2,854 | 295 |
| 2000 | 1,911 | 203 | 738 | 220 | 3,072 | 179 |
| 2001 | 3,833 | 22 | 1,053 | 124 | 5,032 | 22 |
| 2002 | 2,576 | 260 | 1,974 | 348 | 5,158 | 260 |
| 2003 | 4,870 | 0 | 639 | 418 | 5,927 | 0 |
| 2004 | 6,018 | 274 | 1,550 | 334 | 8,176 | 274 |
| 2005 | 12,210 | 269 | 2,356 | 223 | 15,058 | 269 |
| 2006 | 19,870 | 273 | 6,331 | 0 | 26,474 | 273 |
| 2007 | 19,511 | 248 | 5,441 | 71 | 25,271 | 248 |
| 2008 | 13,998 | 241 | 2,582 | 130 | 16,951 | 241 |
| 2009 | 7,270 | 274 | 725 | 73 | 8,342 | 274 |
| 2010 | 4,907 | 59 | 812 | 0 | 5,778 | 59 |
| 2011 | 3,785 | 209 | 457 | 14 | 4,465 | 209 |
| 2012 | 2,554 | 97 | 1,293 | 81 | 4,025 | 97 |
| 2013 | 3,753 | 0 | 819 | 649 | 5,221 | 95 |
| 2014 | 5,171 | 0 | 3,956 | 462 | 9,589 | 0 |
| 2015 | 8,880 | 73 | 3,065 | 607 | 12,622 | 70 |
| 2016 | 6,653 | 0 | 1,602 | 416 | 8,671 | 0 |
| 2017 | 6,906 | 0 | 764 | 688 | 8,358 | 0 |
| 2018 | 9,351 | 0 | 606 | 827 | 10,784 | 12 |

Note: Rehabilitated units were tabulated separately beginning in 1994. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) Plans are a subset of all plans.

Source: New York State Attorney General's Office, Real Estate Financing Bureau

## 7. Tax Incentive Programs, 2016-2018

Buildings Newly Receiving Certificates for 421-a Exemptions, 2016-2018

|  | 2016 |  |  | 2017 |  |  | 2018 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Certificates | Buildings | Units | Certificates | Buildings | Units | Certificates | Buildings | Units |
| Bronx | 8 | 10 | 209 | 273 | 117 | 1,542 | 139 | 204 | 1,874 |
| Brooklyn | 72 | 92 | 2,672 | 162 | 442 | 8,195 | 458 | 594 | 11,841 |
| Manhattan | 16 | 16 | 839 | 63 | 67 | 7,448 | 63 | 64 | 8,884 |
| Queens | 37 | 38 | 773 | 240 | 338 | 3,587 | 373 | 516 | 5,114 |
| Staten Island | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 32 | 4 | 33 | 579 |
| TOTAL | 133 | 156 | 4,493 | 740 | 966 | 20,804 | 1,037 | 1,411 | 28,292 |

Buildings Newly Receiving J-51 Tax Abatements and Exemptions, 2016-2018

|  | 2016 |  |  | 2017 |  |  | 2018 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Buildings | Units | $\begin{gathered} \text { Certified } \\ \text { Cost }(\$ 1,000 \mathrm{~s}) \end{gathered}$ | Buildings | Units | $\begin{gathered} \text { Certified } \\ \text { Cost }(\$ 1,000 \mathrm{~s}) \end{gathered}$ | Buildings | Units | $\begin{gathered} \text { Certified } \\ \text { Cost }(\$ 1,000 \mathrm{~s}) \end{gathered}$ |
| Bronx | 346 | 13,312 | \$22,934 | 180 | 6,519 | \$13,847 | 134 | 7,915 | \$16,993 |
| Brooklyn | 175 | 7,694 | \$18,682 | 126 | 4,625 | \$12,044 | 154 | 7,116 | \$21,274 |
| Manhattan | 40 | 1,778 | \$9,859 | 34 | 3,703 | \$12,578 | 50 | 1,578 | \$11,351 |
| Queens | 1,630 | 11,525 | \$10,807 | 1,072 | 7,992 | \$7,511 | 190 | 13,028 | \$8,705 |
| Staten Island | 1 | 2 | \$65 | 1 | 38 | \$195 | 1 | 178 | \$1,039 |
| TOTAL | 2,192 | 34,311 | \$62,347 | 1,413 | 22,877 | \$46,175 | 529 | 29,815 | \$59,362 |

Source: NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Office of Development, Tax Incentive Programs

## 8. Tax Incentive Programs - Units Receiving Initial Benefits, 1981-2018

| Year | 421-a | $J$-51 | Year | 421-a | J-51 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1981 | 3,505 | -- | 2000 | 2,828 | 83,925 |
| 1982 | 3,620 | -- | 2001 | 4,870 | 81,321 |
| 1983 | 2,088 | -- | 2002 | 4,953 | 70,145 |
| 1984 | 5,820 | -- | 2003 | 3,782 | 74,005 |
| 1985 | 5,478 | -- | 2004 | 6,738 | 117,503 |
| 1986 | 8,569 | -- | 2005 | 5,062 | 66,370 |
| 1987 | 8,286 | -- | 2006 | 3,875 | 66,010 |
| 1988 | 10,079 | 109,367 | 2007 | 4,212 | 55,681 |
| 1989 | 5,342 | 64,392 | 2008 | 4,521 | 64,478 |
| 1990 | 980 | 113,009 | 2009 | 4,613 | 37,867 |
| 1991 | 3,323 | 115,031 | 2010 | 5,895 | 50,263 |
| 1992 | 2,650 | 143,593 | 2011 | 11,007 | 54,775 |
| 1993 | 914 | 122,000 | 2012 | 10,856 | 45,886 |
| 1994 | 627 | 60,874 | 2013 | 7,890 | 55,659 |
| 1995 | 2,284 | 77,072 | 2014 | 6,945 | 40,787 |
| 1996 | 1,085 | 70,431 | 2015 | 5,468 | 44,259 |
| 1997 | 2,099 | 145,316 | 2016 | 4,493 | 34,311 |
| 1998 | 2,118 | 103,527 | 2017 | 20,804 | 22,877 |
| 1999 | 6,123 | 82,121 | 2018 | 28,292 | 29,815 |

Source: NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Office of Development, Tax Incentive Programs

## 9. Building Demolitions in New York City, 1985-2018

|  | Bronx |  | Brooklyn |  | Manhattan |  | Queens |  | Staten Island |  | Total |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | $\begin{gathered} 5+ \\ \text { Units } \end{gathered}$ | Total | 5+ Units | Total | 5+ Units | Total | $\begin{gathered} 5+ \\ \text { Units } \end{gathered}$ | Total | $5+$ Units | Total | $\begin{gathered} 5+ \\ \text { Units } \end{gathered}$ | Total |
| 1985 | 81 | 157 | 3 | 101 | 59 | 73 | 3 | 133 | 1 | 31 | 147 | 495 |
| 1986 | 48 | 96 | 14 | 197 | 19 | 38 | 3 | 273 | 4 | 67 | 88 | 671 |
| 1987 | 14 | 55 | 2 | 130 | 22 | 33 | 1 | 273 | 6 | 83 | 45 | 574 |
| 1988 | 3 | 34 | 2 | 169 | 25 | 44 | 2 | 269 | 0 | 160 | 32 | 676 |
| 1989 | 6 | 48 | 8 | 160 | 20 | 38 | 3 | 219 | 0 | 109 | 37 | 574 |
| 1990 | 4 | 29 | 3 | 133 | 20 | 28 | 5 | 119 | 0 | 71 | 32 | 380 |
| 1991 | 10 | 33 | 15 | 95 | 9 | 14 | 1 | 68 | 0 | 32 | 35 | 242 |
| 1992 | 12 | 51 | 6 | 63 | 2 | 5 | 1 | 41 | 0 | 33 | 21 | 193 |
| 1993 | 0 | 17 | 4 | 94 | 0 | 1 | 3 | 51 | 0 | 5 | 7 | 168 |
| 1994 | 3 | 14 | 4 | 83 | 5 | 5 | 2 | 42 | 0 | 8 | 14 | 152 |
| 1995 | 2 | 18 | 0 | 81 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 37 | 0 | 17 | 4 | 153 |
| 1996 | - | 30 | - | 123 | - | 25 | - | 118 | - | 84 | - | 380 |
| 1997 | - | 29 | - | 127 | - | 51 | - | 168 | - | 119 | - | 494 |
| 1998 | - | 71 | - | 226 | - | 103 | - | 275 | - | 164 | - | 839 |
| 1999 | - | 67 | - | 211 | - | 53 | - | 227 | - | 159 | - | 717 |
| 2000 | - | 64 | - | 499 | - | 101 | - | 529 | - | 307 | - | 1,500 |
| 2001 | - | 96 | - | 421 | - | 160 | - | 519 | - | 291 | - | 1,487 |
| 2002 | - | 126 | - | 500 | - | 89 | - | 600 | - | 456 | - | 1,771 |
| 2003 | - | 161 | - | 560 | - | 100 | - | 865 | - | 564 | - | 2,250 |
| 2004 | - | 238 | - | 691 | - | 141 | - | 1,128 | - | 547 | - | 2,745 |
| 2005 | - | 245 | - | 1,080 | - | 145 | - | 1,545 | - | 477 | - | 3,492 |
| 2006 | - | 334 | - | 1,109 | - | 259 | - | 1,485 | - | 381 | - | 3,568 |
| 2007 | - | 302 | - | 984 | - | 282 | - | 1,407 | - | 308 | - | 3,283 |
| 2008 | - | 206 | - | 925 | - | 252 | - | 1,082 | - | 215 | - | 2,680 |
| 2009 | - | 166 | - | 467 | - | 153 | - | 663 | - | 177 | - | 1,626 |
| 2010 | - | 121 | - | 326 | - | 76 | - | 464 | - | 129 | - | 1,116 |
| 2011 | - | 93 | - | 308 | - | 124 | - | 463 | - | 141 | - | 1,129 |
| 2012 | - | 121 | - | 284 | - | 144 | - | 434 | - | 139 | - | 1,122 |
| 2013 | - | 105 | - | 367 | - | 145 | - | 453 | - | 216 | - | 1,286 |
| 2014 | - | 125 | - | 454 | - | 121 | - | 555 | - | 258 | - | 1,513 |
| 2015 | - | 116 | - | 668 | - | 225 | - | 612 | - | 266 | - | 1,887 |
| 2016 | - | 139 | - | 642 | - | 178 | - | 655 | - | 235 | - | 1,849 |
| 2017 | - | 136 | - | 573 | - | 114 | - | 579 | - | 320 | - | 1,722 |
| 2018 | - | 190 | - | 661 | - | 146 | - | 624 | - | 267 | - | 1,888 |

Note: The Census Bureau discontinued collecting demolition statistics in December, 1995. The New York City Department of Buildings began supplying the total number of buildings demolished from 1996 forward, but does not specify whether buildings are residential or whether they have $5+$ units. Demolition statistics from 1985 though 1995 are solely residential buildings.

Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, Manufacturing and Construction Division, Building Permits Branch; New York City Department of Buildings

