1	
2	THE CITY OF NEW YORK
3	RENT GUIDELINES BOARD
4	X
5	PUBLIC MEETING
6	OF THE
7	DIRECTORS
8	X
9	El Museo del Barrio
10	1230 5th Ave 104th Street
11	New York, NY 10029
12	June 30, 2025
13	7:05 P.M.
14	
15	B E F O R E:
16	
17	DOUG APPLE,
18	THE CHAIR,
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	
2	A P P E A R A N C E S:
3	Board of Directors:
4	Doug Apple, Chair
5	Genesis Aquino
6	Alex Armlovich
7	Alex Schwartz
8	Robert Ehrlich
9	Arpit Gupta
10	Reed Jordan
11	Christina Smyth
12	Adan Soltren
13	
14	S T A F F:
15	Andrew McLaughlin - Executive Director
16	Brian Hoberman - Co-Research Director
17	Danielle Burger - Co-Research Director
18	Charmaine Superville - Office Manager
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	
2	PROCEEDINGS
3	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Good evening.
4	I'm Doug Apple, Chair of the New York City Rent
5	Guidelines Board. I'd like to welcome you to this
6	meeting of the Board. This is the last meeting in
7	a series of public meetings and hearings to
8	determine lease adjustments for rent-stabilized
9	housing units in New York City with leases
10	commencing or being renewed on or after October 1,
11	2025, and on or before September 30th, 2026.
12	I will now take roll call. Please
13	respond if present. Genesis Aquino?
14	MS. AQUINO: Present.
15	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Alex
16	Armlovich?
17	MR. ARMLOVICH: Present.
18	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Robert
19	Ehrlich?
20	MR. EHRLICH: Present.
21	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Arpit Gupta?
22	MR. GUPTA: Present.
23	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Reed Jordan?
24	MR. JORDAN: Present.
25	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Alex

2	Schwartz?

- 3 MR. SCHWARTZ: Present.
- 4 CHAIRMAN APPLE: Christina
- 5 Smyth?
- MS. SMYTH: Present.
- 7 CHAIRMAN APPLE: Adán Soltren?
- MR. SOLTREN: Present.
- 9 CHAIRMAN APPLE: Doug Apple,
- 10 I'm indeed present. Let the record show, we have a
- 11 quorum.
- Before we proceed to motions,
- 13 I'd like to make a few brief comments on this
- 14 process.
- 15 First, I would like to thank
- 16 the many, many of our fellow New Yorkers, tenants,
- 17 owners, advocates, and public officials who have
- 18 participated in this process on determining rent
- 19 adjustments for New York's nearly 1 million
- 20 rent-stabilized apartments. I want to especially
- 21 recognize everyone who testified to their personal
- 22 experience at our five public hearings, as well as
- 23 submitting over 200 written, oral, and video
- 24 submissions.
- 25 Second, I would like to thank

- 2 the staff of the Rent Guidelines Board for their
- 3 exceptional research and analysis, as well as
- 4 coordinating our meetings and public hearings.
- 5 Their professionalism and objectivity are essential
- 6 to assuring that the Board operates in a
- 7 transparent manner.
- Finally, I want to express my
- 9 gratitude to my fellow Board members for
- 10 volunteering their time, their insights, their
- 11 commitment to New Yorkers, and their dedication to
- 12 our work together.
- 13 With that, let me turn to the
- 14 work before us, beginning with our hotel order.
- 15 Since Board members only submitted one proposal
- 16 prior to this meeting, we will now consider
- 17 proposal one for Hotel Order number 55.
- 18 The motion on hotels. I move
- 19 to adopt the final language, a proposal one for
- 20 hotel order number 55. This proposal was
- 21 circulated to the members of the Board and posted
- on the RGB website on June 26th, 2025.
- 23 As I further move to adopt the
- 24 explanatory statement and findings, Hotel Order
- 25 number 55, substantially in the form submitted by

1	
2	staff to the Board as of June 30th, and to be
3	modified by RGB staff after this meeting to reflect
4	the adopted rental adjustments. A summary of hotel
5	proposal number one is as follows:
6	Residential Class A or
7	Apartment hotels, zero percent increase;
8	Lodging houses, zero percent
9	increase;
10	Rooming houses, class B
11	buildings containing less than 30 units, zero
12	percent increase.
13	Class B hotels, zero percent
14	increase.
15	Single room occupancy
16	buildings, multiple dwelling lots section 248 SROs,
17	zero percent increase.
18	May I have a second on the

- 19 motion?
- MR. GUPTA: I second.
- MR. ARMLOVICH: Second.
- 22 CHAIRMAN APPLE: A second.
- 23 I'm now asking for any comments on the motion. Any
- 24 comments?
- 25 (No response.)

1		
2	CHAIRMAN	APPLE: Hearing no
3	comments, I'm going to call th	he vote.
4	CHAIRMAN	APPLE: Genesis
5	Aquino?	
6	MS. AQUI	NO: Yes.
7	CHAIRMAN	APPLE: Alex
8	Armlovich?	
9	MR. ARML	OVICH: Yes.
10	CHAIRMAN	APPLE: Robert
11	Ehrlich?	
12	MR. EHRL	ICH: No.
13	CHAIRMAN	APPLE: Arpit Gupta?
14	MR. GUPT	A: Yes.
15	CHAIRMAN	APPLE: Reed Jordan?
16	MR. JORD	AN: Yes.
17	CHAIRMAN	APPLE: Alex
18	Schwartz?	
19	MR. SCHW	ARTZ: Yes.
20	CHAIRMAN	APPLE: Christina
21	Smyth.	
22	MS. SMYT	H: No.
23	CHAIRMAN	APPLE: Adán Soltren?
24	MR. SOLT	REN: Yes.
25	CHAIRMAN	APPLE: Doug Apple, I

1	
2	vote yes.
3	With that, the motion passes,
4	7 votes to 2
5	We now move on to the
6	Apartment and Loft Order. I like would now to
7	move a motion to adopt the final language of
8	Proposal number 50 of Apartment and Loft Order
9	number 57 that was circulated to the members of the
10	Board and posted on the RGB website on June 26th,
11	2025.
12	And I further move to adopt
13	the explanatory statement and findings for
14	Apartment and Loft Order number 57 substantially in
15	the form submitted by staff to the Board as of June
16	30th, 2025, and to be modified by the RGB staff
17	after this meeting to reflect the adopted rental
18	adjustments.
19	A summary of proposal 50 is as
20	follows:
21	For apartments, a one-year
22	lease, 3 percent increase;
23	(Audience participation.)
24	CHAIRMAN APPLE: For

apartments, a two-year lease, a 4.5 increase;

1	
2	(Audience participation.)
3	CHAIRMAN APPLE: For lofts, a
4	one-year period of a 3 percent increase;
5	(Audience participation.)
6	CHAIRMAN APPLE: And for a
7	two-year period, a 4.5 percent increase.
8	(Audience participation.)
9	CHAIRMAN APPLE: On special
10	guidelines and decontrolled units would be 49
11	percent above the maximum base rent. I asked for a
12	second on that motion.
13	(Audience participation.)
14	MR. GUPTA: I second.
15	CHAIRMAN APPLE: I have a
16	second. I now ask for discussion on this motion,
17	and I want to just remind everybody that all the
18	statements of the Board will be made part of the
19	permanent record and posted on the RGB's website
20	after this hearing. So, I would now ask for a
21	discussion. I'll start with Rob Ehrlich. Please,
22	Rob.
23	MR. EHRLICH: First of all
24	first of all, we would like to thank our fellow

Board members who take this responsibility very

24

25

2	seriously, who have advocated well on behalf of
3	their tenants, owners, and the public. Also, a
4	special thank you to the staff, Andrew, Brian,
5	Danielle, and Charmaine, who make our collective
6	jobs easier. Despite the claims of tenant
7	advocates and many of those who've spoken at public
8	hearings, net operating income is not profit, nor
9	is it revenue.
10	(Audience participation.)
11	MR. EHRLICH: Also, NOI as
12	calculated by this Board, does not include many of
13	the normal costs incurred during the operation of
14	housing. NOI does not include major expenses or
15	updates that are mandated by the city, state, and
16	the federal government. And possibly the most
17	unfortunate thing is that NOI, as reported out by
18	this Board, includes hundreds of thousands of free
19	market apartments with incredibly high rents, which
20	distort the overall data, especially for the
21	majority of rent-stabilized buildings outside the
22	core of Manhattan.
23	In the past 12 years, the RGB

has made a clear shift towards a systematic --

systemic defunding of buildings. They have

2 adjusted	rents	аt	an	average	οf	1	percent	below
------------	-------	----	----	---------	----	---	---------	-------

- 3 inflation; the result has been declining NOI in
- 4 older buildings.
- 5 If this Board is going to
- 6 permanently adjust rents below inflation going
- forward, there is only one outcome; systemic
- 8 failure of the majority of rent-stabilized housing
- 9 stock. This failure will be felt both financially
- 10 and physically.
- 11 We have heard testimony from
- 12 the NYU Furman Center, the Community Preservation
- 13 Corporation, and Enterprise, which confirmed as
- 14 much as 20 percent of all rent-stabilized housing
- is already at risk of foreclosure.
- 16 As we all know, this data lags
- 17 and continue -- and does not include major expenses
- 18 such as capital reserves. So, the actual amount of
- 19 distress is worse. Once again, let us be clear; no
- 20 amount of adjustment approved by this Board this
- 21 evening will save these buildings. The added
- 22 revenue from that adjustment has already been
- 23 spent. This is just what is barely necessary to
- 24 continue at the same level of distress that we are
- 25 currently seeing.

2	Already, we have seen the NOI
3	in pre-1974 buildings outside the core of Manhattan
4	decline by more than 25 percent from 2020 to 2023,
5	adjusting for inflation. All of the data available
6	to us shows that this decline is a clear trend,
7	which is growing. Data presented next year will
8	show that 2024 was worse, and 2025 will be worse
9	than that.
10	From a building operations
11	standpoint, rent adjustments below inflation are
12	rollbacks that force owners building owners to
13	cut costs. We saw in our data this year that
14	spending on maintenance and repairs declined in
15	2023. Sadly, repairs and maintenance is one of the
16	few costs housing operators can cut to keep their
17	businesses afloat. Most costs are controlled by
18	the government, yet these continue to rise
19	unabated.
20	(Audience participation.)
21	MS. SMYTH: Violations continue to
22	increase since 2019, when Albany passed the HSTPA
23	and the systemic defunding of these buildings
24	began. With respect to we respect all our
25	colleagues up here. We understand that this is a

2	verv	difficult	decision	and	t.hat.	this	Board	is	put
_	$v \subset \bot y$	α \perp \perp \perp \subset α \perp \subset	accide	ana	CIIGC		Doara	\pm \circ	puc

- 3 in a position each year to the utter failures of
- 4 the state elected officials and the city government
- 5 to address the high cost of housing and the abject
- 6 lack of supply.
- 7 These are the very same public
- 8 officials who come to our Board to testify for rent
- 9 freezes while residing in rent-stabilized
- 10 apartments. This blatant conflict of interest,
- 11 which at minimum should be fully disclosed prior to
- 12 their testimony, goes unnoticed year after year.
- 13 Yet the same politicians repeatedly fail to address
- 14 property tax reform. Taxes and insurance increases
- 15 year over year are devastating older rent
- 16 stabilized buildings, add high water and sewer
- 17 costs, and an 11 percent Con Edison rate hike.
- 18 When the government continues to
- 19 fail, the responsibility for long-term viability of
- 20 the rent-stabilized housing stock falls on this
- 21 Rent Guidelines Board. If we continue to adjust
- 22 rates below inflation, we are dooming buildings to
- 23 failure. At a bare minimum, inflation needs to be
- 24 the starting point for discussions on rent
- 25 adjustments.

24

25

Τ.	
2	This year, inflation is 4 percent.
3	It should be the starting point for a rent
4	adjustment on one-year leases. This Board,
5	mandated to be independent under any mayor who
6	comes down the road, cannot continue to operate in
7	a bubble. These buildings are systematically
8	defunded term after term, and it's on the watch of
9	elected officials.
10	Sadly, anything that happens
11	tonight will not solve the serious housing crisis
12	that faces the not-for-profit housing providers,
13	the supportive housing providers, the public
14	housing providers, nor the private owners who the
15	activists love to vilify. It's on you elected New
16	York City. This crisis is on you.
17	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Done? Thank you.
18	Are there other statements from members? Jordan?
19	No.
20	MR. ARMLOVICH: I'm happy to. I
21	mean, it's up to you. Do you want me to?
22	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Alex Armlovich?
23	MR. ARMLOVICH: Great. I wanted

to share a brief statement. I wanted to say that

today's guidelines represented a difficult

24

25

2	compromise between the competing testimonies that
3	we received. A one-year guideline, it most closely
4	reflects the testimony we heard from civic
5	organizations, regulated nonprofit affordable
6	housing providers, and think tanks with respect to
7	financial distress, specifically in the non-profit
8	affordable housing stock. After 10 years in a row
9	of one-year guidelines below the rate of New York
LO	City area inflation, the longest up stretch of real
L1	dollar one-year rollbacks in our history as a
L2	Board. The status of New York's non-profit social
L3	housing is troubled.
L 4	This year, the Community
L5	Preservation Corporation and Enterprise Community
L 6	Partners took the unprecedented step of opening
L 7	their books to us. The results were troubling. In
L 8	balancing consideration, however, we also received
L 9	testimony for the first time from the Fiscal Policy
20	Institute. And that testimony raised the idea of
21	New York City CPI less shelter as an interesting
22	and useful lower bound estimate of the likely
23	changes in operating costs over time.

perspective and the data is lagging. It's

So, our guidelines are

2	retrospective. But we nonetheless expect the
3	one-year guideline to prove to be the 11th real
4	dollar rollback in a row below New York City
5	inflation yet again? But likely quite close to the
6	Fiscal Policy Institute's New York City Less
7	Shelter Index when next year's data comes out.
8	I will submit the rest of my
9	testimony in writing for consideration by the
10	public and the rest of the Board. Thank you.
11	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Thank you. Is
12	there any other statements for the record in
13	discussion? Please, Adán.
14	MR. SOLTREN: Good evening.
15	(Applause.)
16	(audience participation.).
17	MR. SOLTREN: Good evening. Good
18	evening, everyone. So, being as this is my fourth
19	year, you know, I rather than throw statistics and
20	make all of the totally legitimate arguments that I
21	would normally make, I'm taking a different route
22	because I want to share some insights and really
23	talk to you all because I think that's what's most
24	important right now.

Seeing how my colleagues on

2	this	Board	are	set	to	increase	your	rents	an

- 3 additional 3 percent this year, that's 12 percent
- in total the last four years, if anyone's been
- 5 counting.
- 6 (Audience participation.)
- 7 MR. SOLTREN: I just want to
- 8 share that I've realized in this fourth season that
- 9 this Board does not value affordability. It
- 10 doesn't in any meaningful way. There is no way
- 11 that we could come to these decisions for the
- 12 fourth time in a row if we did.
- 13 Instead, much like normalizing
- 14 the traumatic depictions that we see on television
- 15 and on social media these days, of human rights
- 16 abuses, of civil rights abuses, civil liberties
- 17 abuses, atrocities, and inequities, we as a Board
- 18 have co-signed the normalization of
- 19 unaffordability, housing insecurity, and abject
- 20 poverty.
- 21 (Audience participation.)
- MR. SOLTREN: I feel I must
- 23 stay as clearly as I can as a public servant and as
- 24 an advocate for the people, that this is not
- 25 normal. Let me repeat, this is not normal. When

_	
2	you see human suffering, it is not normal to take
3	actions and directly add to their suffering.
4	(Audience participation).
5	MR. SOLTREN: That is why we must
6	continue to take all steps necessary to organize,
7	resist, and push back against these injustices
8	because we know this is not normal and it is
9	unacceptable. There is a better way, I'm certain.
L 0	Our job as a Board is to review data from various
L1	sources related to housing, including
L2	affordability, in case some of you have forgotten,
L3	and make decisions that protect people, not
L 4	buildings, not businesses. People.
L5	(Audience participation.)
L 6	MR. SOLTREN: Pouring over
L7	decimals and percentages from an ivory tower,
L 8	focusing on the equal health of businesses and
L 9	physical structures while paying short shrift to
20	the struggles of actual human beings is
21	unconscionable.
22	What's more is that in ignoring
23	your struggles, in the data, they're ignoring you
24	when you are telling them well, what's more, in

addition to ignoring your struggles as expressed in

25

2	the data, they're ignoring you when they are
3	telling them repeatedly to their faces and even in
4	more dire circumstances, that you need help only
5	for them to ignore you and give benefits to
6	businesses instead.
7	Since when does it make sense to
8	see a person drowning and yelling for help, only to
9	throw the lifeguard a life preserver?
LO	(Audience participation.)
L1	MR. SOLTREN: These are undisputed
L2	facts; the rent-stabilized housing stock is in
L3	declining physical shape, and something needs to be
L 4	done to preserve these apartments. That is a fact.
L5	Taxes and insurance costs for most
L 6	landlords are going up. That's also a fact. But
L7	do you know what else is a fact? Neither of those
L 8	things is in the control of rent-stabilized
L 9	tenants. Do you know what else is a fact? People
20	are paying the rent in record numbers, often to the
21	point of being rent-burdened themselves just to
22	stay in their homes.
23	Do you know what another fact is?
24	That landlords have the possibility of making more

profits and more money because of their economic

2	positioning than tenants do.
3	(Audience participation.)
4	MR. SOLTREN: And lastly, another
5	fact is that wage growth has not and will not
6	continue to make up for the rental burdens that
7	people are incurring in one of the most
8	unaffordable cities in the world.
9	Based on these facts, it's
10	completely unreasonable and cruel to conclude that
11	A, the problem is solely how to preserve buildings
12	and businesses, and B, that the solution to that
13	problem is raising rents on millions of people.
14	If you actually cared about New
15	Yorkers and saw them as your neighbors, your family
16	members, your friends, you would understand that
17	the only option is to freeze the rent
18	(Audience participation.)
19	MR. SOLTREN: and encourage
20	other government entities and lobbyists to create
21	solutions to the problems that business owners are
22	facing. Anything less than that continues the
23	cycle of dehumanizing tenants and normalizing their
24	continued struggle and abuse in such an inequitable
25	system.

1	
2	MALE VOICE: Evil.
3	MR. SOLTREN: Because the Board
4	doesn't value your affordability testimony, and
5	those most deeply affected bias decisions, I'd like
6	to recenter your voices.
7	MALE VOICE: They belong in hell.
8	MR. SOLTREN: This is about
9	normalizing each other's humanity and motivating
10	each other to help people see it. In case any of
11	you may have forgotten, here are some of the things
12	we heard from real people who took time out of
13	their busy, complicated, and difficult lives to
14	beg, plead, demand, or request from you all to not
15	raise the rent. Otherwise, they'll have to
16	struggle harder in the next few years.
17	"When will you finally listen and
18	freeze the rent?" Said the wheelchair bound
19	military vet, whose VA Benefits are insufficient to
20	meet his daily needs.
21	"We are not asking you for favors.
22	We are asking for fairness." Said the Brooklyn
23	College student, single working mother, and
24	survivor of domestic violence.

"Why do I have to plead with you

2	all	and	try	to	make	it	SO	that	you	unde	erstand	that
3	this	is	abou	t l	numan	dic	nit	.y?"	Said	the	severe	Ly

- 4 rent-burdened school teacher, paying more than 65
- 5 percent of her income on rent.
- 6 "Please freeze the rent." We heard
- 7 from the girl who had -- who was more -- no more
- 8 than eight years old, who advocated on behalf of
- 9 her family to freeze the rent so her parents don't
- 10 have to work multiple jobs and so they wouldn't
- 11 have to keep missing her school events.
- 12 FEMALE VOICE: Are you
- 13 kidding?
- 14 MR. SOLTREN: "Please remember
- that we are human beings." "Rent increases our
- 16 tightening the nooses around our necks." "We are
- 17 human beings too." "How much greed is enough?"
- 18 "Housing security is essential to stability."
- 19 "Think about what we are saying to you." "Sympathy,
- 20 sympathy. That is all that we are asking for."
- 21 (Audience participation.)
- 22 MR. SOLTREN: No one should have
- 23 to plead, beg, request, or demand dignity,
- 24 compassion, or fairness from an unelected body of
- 25 people who do not understand nor seek to understand

2	the	hardships	s of	their	realities.

- In closing, I want to remind you,
- 4 it does not need to be this way. The power has
- 5 been and always will be with the people. Remember
- 6 that this is not normal, and we can change these
- 7 systems. We can change our decision makers and
- 8 outcomes like these. Stay strong, have a good
- 9 night, y'all.
- 10 (Audience participation.)
- 11 CHAIRMAN APPLE: Thank you. Are
- there any other discussions by members? Please,
- 13 Genesis Aquino?
- 14 (Audience participation.)
- MS. AQUINO: In 2023, my rent was
- 16 \$1,400. \$1,400. Now my rent increased \$129,
- 17 right? Since 2023, \$129. That's about one-third,
- or I guess over one-third of somebody's SSI or
- 19 somebody's SSD. At least, I would say it would
- 20 make a rent burden or even more rent burden, about
- 21 half of the people that testify in all the hearings
- 22 that we had. So, why would I vote in favor of my
- 23 own displacement, right?
- 24 (Applause.)
- MS. AQUINO: \$129 in my building,

- 2 I got -- there's no new boiler, there's no new
- 3 windows. My windows were installed 15 years ago.
- 4 There's no super in my building. There's no
- 5 investment at all that justify \$129 since 2023.
- 6 (Audience participation.)
- 7 MS. AQUINO: So, again, I'm just a
- 8 privileged tenant. I'm just a privileged tenant,
- 9 right? But it means, you know, my neighbor --
- 10 well, somebody, let's say Mr. Joseph, who lives at
- 11 1365 for Washington, he needs to move to a room,
- 12 right? He needs to leave his rent-stabilized
- 13 apartment and move to a room. And he's looking for
- 14 a room because he cannot afford the rent. He's in
- 15 housing court, and he's going to be moving from
- 16 room to room.
- 17 (audience participation.)
- 18 MS. AQUINO: A room -- a room is a
- 19 \$1,000, nowadays. Imagine that. Right? My
- 20 grandfather gets his Social Security. He was an
- 21 electrician. He retired. He gets a pension of
- 22 \$908. Where is he going to find an apartment? If
- 23 he is -- he -- that means he needs to live with us,
- 24 right? And that's the same reality for many of the
- 25 tenants here. We have to leave a -- how do you

1	
2	call it?
3	(Audience participation.)
4	MS. AQUINO: Yeah. Overcrowded.
5	Overcrowded. So, we I think the tenants I
6	think we spoke very clearly this year. We demanded
7	a rent freeze. We elected a mayor that supports a
8	rent freeze.
9	(Audience participation.)
10	MS. AQUINO: Hopefully it
11	cannot it cannot it cannot be more clear
12	it cannot be more clear than that. We may not win
13	in November, but we need
14	FEMALE VOICE: We will.
15	MS. AQUINO: Let's say, we'll,
16	we'll but we whether we win or not, we have
17	the we are strong enough to win our power to get
18	rid of this type of war. To right?
19	(Audience participation.)
20	MS. AQUINO: To bring systems that
21	actually work for us. The working class and the
22	people that actually have New York standing, right?
23	So, continue fighting. We want the rent freeze.
24	(Audience participation.)
25	MR. ARMLOVICH: Typically,

1	
2	I'll say the last paragraph of my testimony.
3	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Are there any
4	other members who wish to speak?
5	(No response.)
6	CHAIRMAN APPLE: With that,
7	with no further discussion, I will now call the
8	vote. Genesis Aquino?
9	MS. AQUINO: No.
10	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Alex
11	Armlovich?
12	MR. ARMLOVICH: Yes.
13	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Robert
14	Ehrlich?
15	MR. EHRLICH: No.
16	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Arpit Gupta?
17	MR. GUPTA: Yes.
18	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Reed Jordan?
19	MR. JORDAN: Yes.
20	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Alex
21	Schwartz?
22	MR. SCHWARTZ: Yes.
23	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Christina
24	Smyth?
25	MS. SMYTH: No.

1	
2	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Adán Soltren?
3	MR. SOLTREN: Nope.
4	CHAIRMAN APPLE: And Doug
5	Apple, I vote yes.
6	(Audience participation.)
7	CHAIRMAN APPLE: With that, by
8	a vote of $5-4$, the motion has passed.
9	(Audience participation.)
10	CHAIRMAN APPLE: Before we
11	close, please note that I have a statement that
12	outlines my rationale for this outcome that will be
13	posted on the RGB website.
14	It is the role of this Board
15	to balance the reality of rising costs and
16	financing challenges facing owners with what are
17	deep affordability challenges facing tenants. This
18	is never an easy task and is one that is critical
19	to the future of this essential component of the
20	city's housing stock.
21	The statement will be
22	available at the conclusion of this meeting, and I
23	would instruct the RGB staff to include this
24	statement and all the other statements made tonight

as a part of the record and transcript of the

1	
2	meeting. With that, I ask for a motion to adjourn.
3	MR. GUPTA: So motioned.
4	CHAIRMAN APPLE: We have a
5	motion. And a second?
6	MS. SMYTH: Second.
7	CHAIRMAN APPLE: And I have a
8	second. With that, this meeting is adjourned.
9	Thank you very much.
10	(At 7:35 P.M., the proceedings
11	were concluded.)
12	(THE FOLLOWING STATEMENTS WERE
13	INSERTED INTO THE RECORD.)
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	STATEMENTS

2	Ву	Doug	Apple,	Chair	οf	the	New	York	City	Rent
---	----	------	--------	-------	----	-----	-----	------	------	------

- 3 Guidelines Board.
- The New York City Rent
- 5 Stabilization Law of 1969 (RSL) and the New York
- 6 State Emergency Tenant Protection Act of 1974
- 7 (ETPA) each made findings of "a serious public
- 8 emergency" in housing, an emergency that
- 9 unfortunately continues to this day. These laws
- 10 accordingly enacted a legislative scheme with the
- 11 purpose of "prevent[ing] speculative, unwarranted
- and abnormal increases in rents, " "prevent[ing]
- 13 exaction of unjust, unreasonable and oppressive
- rents and rental agreements," and "forestall[ing]
- 15 profiteering, speculation and other disruptive
- 16 practices." ETPA § 2; RSL § 26-501.
- 17 To achieve these goals, the law
- 18 tasks the Board with setting annual guidelines for
- 19 the "adjustment of the level of fair rents," RSL §
- 20 26-510(h). In doing so, the law directs the Board
- 21 to review and consider:
- 22 (1) the economic condition of the
- 23 residential real estate industry in New York City
- 24 including such factors as the prevailing and
- 25 projected (i) real estate taxes and sewer and water

2	rates,	(ii)	gros	s operating	mai	intenance costs,	
3	(iii)	cost	and a	<i>y</i> ailability	of	financing and	

4 interest rates and (iv) supply of housing and

5 vacancy rates;

6 (2) relevant data from the current

7 and projected cost of living indices for New York

8 City;

9 And (3) such other data as has

10 been made available to us-including the impact of

11 any rent adjustment on tenant affordability.

12 This year - as with many other

13 years- the public discussion centered on tenant

14 affordability and the financial condition of the

15 rent-stabilized stock. Income and expense data for

16 owners reflects the complexity of this issue as it

17 relates to the building's financial conditions.

News headlines reported data from the RGB 2025

19 Income and Expense Study, that Net Operating Income

20 (NOI) increased from 2022 to 2023 by 12.1% in all

21 building throughout NYC containing at least one

22 rent-stabilized unit. While this is true, a more

23 comprehensive look reveals that NOI of buildings

24 Citywide that are 100% rent-stabilized only

increased by 0.7% after taking inflation into

2	account,	as r	eported	in	a	RGB	staff	2025	Inco	ome	and
3	Expense	Study	memo.	Anc	d ,	as	reporte	ed in	the	202	25

- 4 Income and Expense Study Report Presentation, since
- 5 2017-18, real NOI (after inflation) for
- 6 rent-stabilized buildings outside of Manhattan's
- 7 core decreased by 13.6%.
- 8 As prior Chairs have noted, there
- 9 is no simple formula for determining fair rent
- 10 adjustments based on the significant and detailed
- 11 data presented to the Board. It is important to
- 12 recognize that owners face significant challenges
- 13 maintaining the quality of rent-stabilized housing
- 14 and preserving this vital stock for tenants in the
- 15 long run. As measured by the RGB's 2025 Price
- 16 Index of Operating Costs Report, prices facing
- owners rose 6.3% from April 2024 through March
- 18 2025, following the previous year's increase of
- 19 3.9%. It is likely that elements of these trends,
- 20 including rising insurance costs and property
- 21 taxes, will persist, with RGB staff projecting that
- the rise in prices will increase by 4.8% next year.
- In addition to the staff reports,
- 24 we received expert testimony from more than 20
- 25 organizations and housing professionals. Notably,

24

25

2	the Furman Center of New York University, the
3	Community Preservation Corporation, Enterprise
4	Community Partners and the Citizens Budget
5	Commission all presented testimony on the changes
6	faced by the rent-stabilized stock, with rising
7	costs and inflation outpacing the modest rent
8	increases over the past several years.
9	As I have considered this year's
10	guidelines, I am mindful of the deep affordability
11	challenges facing tenants in rent-stabilized
12	housing. The RGB's 2025 Income and Affordability
13	Study highlighted persistent and growing challenges
14	for tenants, with average inflation-adjusted wages
15	down 0.4% in the most recent time period studied
16	(the 4th quarter of 2023 through the 3rd quarter of
17	2024). And, the rent tenants face continues to be
18	significant, as indicated by the most recent
19	Housing and Vacancy Survey (HVS) that reported that
20	the median gross rent for rent-stabilized tenants
21	was 30.5% of household income in 2023 (though down
22	from 36.2% in 2021). The HVS also reported that
23	the proportion of rent stabilized tenants that do

not receive rental assistance that were considered

rent burdened was 45.5%, which includes 18.3%

2	paying	more	than	30%	οf	their	income	in	rent	and
---	--------	------	------	-----	----	-------	--------	----	------	-----

- 3 27.2% paying more than 50% of their income in
- 4 contract rent.
- 5 While rental assistance can
- 6 mitigate this burden for some tenants-with the
- 7 median gross rent-to-income ratio for
- 8 rent-stabilized tenants excluding those receiving
- 9 rental assistance currently at 28.8%-the data
- 10 nonetheless indicate a steep rent burden for many
- 11 rent-stabilized tenants. In addition to the RGB
- 12 studies, we heard from the Fiscal Policy Institute
- 13 (FPI) and Columbia Center on Poverty and Social
- 14 Policy, among others, who cited the continued
- 15 challenges of tenant affordability. Columbia's
- 16 research shows that 27% of families in
- 17 rent-stabilized housing are in poverty and 62% are
- 18 low income, and FPI's presentation showed that
- 19 renters' incomes have only grown by 11.5% between
- 20 2019 and 2023 while housing costs grew by nearly
- 21 18%.
- 22 The supply of housing available to
- 23 rent remains extremely tight, with a citywide
- 24 vacancy rate of 1.41 % for rent-stabilized
- 25 apartments in 2023, down from 4.54% in 2021. And

- 3 the near term. The number of new residential
- 4 permits issued in 2024 was the lowest since 2017.
- 5 However, one encouraging data point was that the
- 6 RGB's Changes to the Rent Stabilized Housing Stock
- 7 in NYC in 2024 report showed a net gain of nearly
- 8 14,898 units to the rent stabilized stock.
- 9 Another notable trend is the
- 10 on-going decline in sales price for rent-stabilized
- 11 buildings. The average per-unit sales price
- 12 citywide in 2024 was \$253,389, an
- inflation-adjusted decrease of 28.9% from the prior
- 14 year. Of 100% stabilized buildings, the average
- 15 price per unit sold in 2024 was \$175,225, an
- 16 inflation-adjusted decline of 37.6%. And, as
- 17 reflected in the 2025 Mortgage Survey Report, the
- 18 average interest rate for new multi-family loans
- 19 for buildings with rent-stabilized units was 6.73%,
- 20 a decline of 28 basis points from 2024, but still
- 21 well above the average rate in 2023 of 6.02%.
- 22 Falling sales price and historically higher
- interest rates, in the longer term, could have an
- 24 impact on building conditions as owners struggle to
- 25 access the needed capital for major capital

	9
1	
2	upgrades. It is important that the Board keep a
3	close watch on the physical conditions of buildings
4	as reflected by code violation data and we
5	urge future Boards to develop new data and
6	reporting to closely track buildings' physical
7	conditions.
8	In sum, the data noted above, as
9	well as additional data presented to the Board,
10	underscore that owner costs are continuing to rise,
11	and there is reason to be concerned about the long
12	term health of the stock of rent-stabilized
13	housing. With tenant affordability a real concern,
14	it is critical that the Board balance these equally
15	important considerations as we seek to ensure the
16	stability of the rent stabilization system for
17	tenants and owners and preserve this critical
18	component of the City's housing stock. I believe
19	this year's guidelines strike the appropriate
20	balance.
21	
22	
23	

24

By Alex Armlovich, Public member RGB

2	Today's guidelines represent a
3	nuanced compromise between the competing
4	testimonies the RGB received.
5	The 3% one-year guideline most
6	closely reflects the testimony we heard from
7	leading civic organizations, regulated nonprofit
8	affordable housing operators, and think tanks with
9	respect to financial distress in the nonprofit
10	affordable housing stock. After 10 years in a row
11	of 1-year guidelines below the rate of NYC-area
12	inflation-the longest such stretch of real-dollar
13	1-year rent rollbacks in RGB history-the status of
14	New York's nonprofit social housing is troubled.
15	This year the Community Preservation Corporation
16	and Enterprise Community Partners took the
17	unprecedented step of opening their books to us:
18	The results were troubling.
19	In balancing consideration,
20	however, we also received testimony from the Fiscal
21	Policy Institute (also for the first time) on the
22	use of "NYC CPI less shelter" as a useful
23	lower-bound estimate of the likely change in
24	operating costs of housing over time. Our
25	guidelines are prospective, and the data is

2	retrospective, but we nonetheless expect the 1-year
3	guideline will prove to be the 11th real-dollar
4	rent rollback in a row-below NYC inflation yet
5	again-but likely quite close to FPI's "NYC CPI less
6	shelter" index when next year's data comes in.
7	The 4.5% two-year guideline most
8	closely reflects the testimony we heard from
9	tenants. Over the next two years covered by our
10	guidelines, no measure of inflation or operating
11	costs is expected by any professional forecaster
12	consensus, bond market breakeven, or overnight
13	indexed swap market to fall below 4.5%
14	cumulatively. To the senior citizens and veterans
15	who testified: We heard you. Based on Social
16	Security Administration COLA forecasts for 2026 and
17	2027, this 2-year guideline represents
18	approximately a 0.5% cumulative real rent rollback
19	over two years. In plain language that means
20	seniors' and veterans' rent relative to their
21	incomes will go down, as SSA and VA COLAs for
22	people on a fixed income are slated to phase in at
23	a markedly higher rate than this guideline.
24	The net effect of these

guidelines-a small real-dollar rollback on the

1	
2	1-year, and a large real-dollar rollback on the
3	2-year-on distress in the housing stock will depend
4	on how many tenants take the two-year versus the
5	one-year guidelines, in addition of course to the
6	realized evolution of operating costs and inflation
7	compared to current expectations.
8	Finally, on matters of building
9	quality and habitability, we were moved by the
10	urgent calls to address housing quality offered by
11	a majority of speakers. Taxation, subsidy, and
12	most regulatory powers remain beyond the remit of
13	the RGB. Still, I hope to explore any possible RGB
14	path to creating both the means and the incentive
15	for regulated landlords to meet the customer
16	service and habitability expectations that tenants
17	rightly hold.
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	

Taking inflation into account,

By Alex Schwartz, Public member RGB

24

- 2 as one must, the RGB during the first three years
- 3 of the Adams Administration has not only frozen the
- 4 rent, but rolled it back by 2.9%. This is based on
- 5 the RGB's composite measure of its rent
- 6 adjustments, which combines the maximum allowable
- 7 rent change for 1- and 2-year leases and, before
- 8 2020, the maximum allowable increase for vacancies
- 9 (Prior to the passage of the Housing Stability and
- 10 Tenant Protection Act of 2019, landlords could
- 11 increase rents for vacated rent-stabilized units by
- 12 up to 20%).
- 13 During the de Blasio
- 14 Administration the RGB also reduced rents according
- 15 to this metric. Adjusting for inflation, RGB cut
- 16 rents by 1.7%. But this was only because of its
- 17 low rent increases during Covid, when inflation
- 18 spiked. In contrast, from October 2014 through
- 19 September 2020, the RGB under Mayor De Blasio
- 20 increased the rent by 4.3% adjusting for inflation,
- 21 and this includes two years when it froze rents for
- 22 1-year leases.
- When rents increase more slowly
- than inflation, less money is available for
- 25 building owners to cover essential repairs,

2	building	improvements,	and	their	mortgage	payments
---	----------	---------------	-----	-------	----------	----------

- 3 This is not only true for
- 4 properties under private for-profit ownership, but
- 5 also for buildings owned by nonprofit affordable
- 6 housing groups. Furthermore, about 25% of all rent
- 7 stabilized housing was built or preserved under New
- 8 York's various affordable housing programs, costing
- 9 the city more than \$30 billion from 1987 through
- 10 2023, adjusting for inflation.
- 11 Failing to keep rents at least
- 12 level with inflation degrades the physical and
- 13 financial viability of New York's affordable
- 14 housing investments, as well as the rent-stabilized
- 15 housing stock overall.
- 16 It is essential for rents to be
- 17 kept as low as possible for tenants of
- 18 rent-stabilized housing. But it is also essential
- 19 to ensure that rent-stabilized housing generates
- 20 sufficient income to cover its basic needs. When
- 21 rent adjustments consistently lag behind inflation,
- 22 the physical and financial condition of
- 23 rent-stabilized housing deteriorates. This is
- 24 especially true for predominantly rent-stabilized
- 25 buildings containing few if any market-rate

_				
2	272	rtm	-n+	
Z .	aνa	. I L III	-11	. O .

- RGB staff research and testimony
- 4 presented to the board indicate that
- 5 rent-stabilized housing is under increased stress:
- 6 The Net Operating Incomes (NOI) of
- 7 pre-1974 buildings located outside of core
- 8 Manhattan decreased by 13.1% from 2021-23.
- 9 Outside core Manhattan 10% of all
- 10 rent-stabilized buildings reported negative NOI in
- 11 2023-1,265 in total--meaning their operating costs
- 12 exceeded total rental and other income. This
- percentage rises to 11.3% for pre-1974 buildings
- 14 that are at least 80% rent-stabilized.
- 15 The Community Preservation
- 16 Corporation, a major nonprofit lender for
- 17 affordable housing providers, reported that 20% of
- 18 the loans in their portfolio involved buildings did
- 19 not have sufficient NOI to fully cover their
- 20 mortgage payments, and that 8% of their loans were
- 21 delinquent.
- 22 Testimony from the NYU Furman
- 23 Center showed evidence of deferred maintenance from
- 24 2019 through 20213 in predominantly rent-stabilized
- 25 buildings in the Bronx with below-median rents.

1	
2	From October 2024 to May 2025 the
3	average monthly consumer price index (the primary
4	measure of inflation), for the New York Metro area
5	increased by 3.1% compared to the monthly average
6	from Oct. 2023 to Sept. 2024). To preserve the
7	financial and physical condition of rent-stabilized
8	housing, it is essential for rents to increase at a
9	similar pace. This is why I support the rent
10	adjustment guidelines for the coming year.
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	By Reed Jordan, Public Member RGB

As a first-year public member

24

25

2	of the Rent Guidelines Board, I have witnessed
3	through hearings, expert testimony, and data
4	analysis how this Board is asked to reconcile
5	fundamentally incompatible positions between
6	tenants and owners.
7	I want to address one area of
8	disagreement where productive conversation is both
9	possible and urgently needed for the future of
L 0	affordable housing in our city: that is, the divide
L1	between the tenants' rights movement; and
L2	non-profit, mission-driven owners of affordable
L3	housing.
L 4	This Board has received starkly
L5	different messages from these two groups:
L 6	The tenants' rights movement, in
L7	calling for a rent freeze, rightly points to
L 8	stagnant wages for the city's poor and working
L 9	class, ever rising costs of food, healthcare, and
20	childcare, and threats to social safety programs
21	like Medicaid, SNAP, and Section 8 that would cause
22	enormous harm;
23	Non-profit owners, while not

representing the entire rent-stabilized stock,

manage a substantial portion of the city's

25

2	regulated housing and are charged with maintaining
3	critical social infrastructure. Many emerged from
4	earlier iterations of the very tenants' rights
5	movement now calling for a rent freeze, and they
6	are essential to realizing that movement's vision
7	for housing removed from the speculative market.
8	These non-profit organizations
9	face undeniable financial strain from inflation,
10	rising operating costs, and higher rates of
11	non-payment of rent than before the pandemic. They
12	have asked this Board to increase rents to match
13	inflation as a means to maintain the physical
14	conditions and ensure the long-term sustainability
15	of rent-stabilized housing.
16	These two groups-which have the
17	greatest potential to reconcile the fundamental
18	tensions in our housing system-now find themselves
19	taking opposing positions on what this Board should
20	do.
21	I urge these natural allies to
22	come together, discuss their differences, and
23	create a shared long-term vision for the city's
24	rent-stabilized housing. This vision must extend

beyond this Board's narrow scope and its blunt

1	
2	tools to include a comprehensive look at the City's
3	capital budget and state-level policy.
4	The future of affordable housing
5	in New York depends on finding common ground
6	between those who have fought longest and hardest
7	to protect it.
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	STATE OF NEW YORK)
25	SS.

1	
2	COUNTY OF NEW YORK)
3	
4	
5	I, MARC RUSSO, a Shorthand
6	(Stenotype) Reporter and Notary Public within and
7	for the State of New York, do hereby certify that
8	the foregoing pages 1 through 46, taken at the time
9	and place aforesaid, is a true and correct
10	transcription of the above matter.
11	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have
12	hereunto set my name this 14th day of July, 2025.
13	marc Pusso
14	MARC RUSSO
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

< Dates >	\$ 2 5 3 3 4 : 1 4		3 1 : 1 6 ,
1.7%. 39:18	\$30 40:11		3 2 : 1 4 ,
13.6%. 31:8	\$ 9 0 8 2 4 : 2 3	<2>	3 4 : 1 9
14th day of	3300 24.23	2 8:4, 29:17,	2026 37:18
July, 2025.		30:7	2027 37:18
4 6 : 1 4	< 0 >	2 - year 37:19,	225 34:17
	0.4% 32:17	3 9 : 9	248 6: 16
2.9%. 39:6 3.9%. 31:20	0.4 % 32.17 0.5 % 37:20		25 12:4
37.6%.	0.5 % 37.20 0.7 % 31:2	2 - year - on	25 % 40:8
34:18	0.7 % 31.2	3 8 : 5	26 - 501 29:17
6.02%.	0 5 1 : 1 3	20 11:14,	
3 4 : 2 3	05 1.13	3 2 : 2 2 0 % 3 9 : 1 4 ,	26-510(h 29:21
April 2024		41:19	265 41:13
31:18	<1>	200 4:23	27% 33:18
June 26th,	1 4:19, 11:2,	2017 34:6	27.2% 33: 18
2025.	29:23,	2017 34 0 2017 - 18 31:6	28 34:22
5:22, 8:10	4 6 : 1 0	2019 12:22,	28.8%-the
June 30, 2025	1 - 39:9	33:22,	3 3 : 1 1
1:12	1 - 3 9 . 9 1 - year 3 6 : 1 3 ,	3 9 : 1 2 , 4 2 : 2	28.9% 34:15
June 30th,	36:15,	2020 12:4,	20.9/0 34.13
6:2	37:4, 38:4,	3 9 : 1 0	
June 30th,	39:24	2021 32:24,	< 3 >
2025 , 8:15	1.41 34:2	3 4 : 3	3 8:22, 9:4,
March 2025,	1.4 1 34.2 10 15:8,	2021-23 41:10	17:3, 30:10
31:18	36:12	20213 42:2	3 % 3 6 : 7
May 6:18	10% 41:11	20213 42.2 2022 30:21	3.1% 42:7
May 2025	100% 31:1,	2023 12:4,	3. 1 % 4 2 . 7 3.0 6 : 1 1
4 2 : 4	3 4 : 1 6	12:15,	30% 33:4
November,	10029 1:11	23:16,	30.5% 32:23
25:14	104th 1:10	23:10,	35 28:11
October 1,	11 13:17	30:21,	36.2% 32:24
2025 , 3:10	11.3% 41.15	3 2 : 1 8 ,	389 34:14
October 2014	11.5 % 33:21	3 2 : 2 3 ,	3 r d 3 2 : 1 8
39:20	11. 5 % 33. 21 11th 16: 3,	3 3 : 2 2 ,	31 u 32.10
October 2024	37:5	3 4 : 3 ,	
42:4	12 10:23,	3 4 : 2 3 ,	<4>
September	17:3	40:12, 42:8	4 14:2
2020,	12.1% 30.21	2023-1 41:13	4.3 % 39:22
39:21	1230 1:10	2023. 24:6	4.5 9:1, 9:7
September	13.1% 41.10	2024 12:8,	4.5 % 37:9,
30th, 2026.	1 3 6 5 2 4 : 1 2	32:19,	37:15
3:11	1 4 3 4 : 1 0	34:6, 34:9,	4.54% 34:3
\$1 23:17,	15 24:4	34:14,	4.8 % 31:23
24:20	18 % 33:23	3 4 : 1 7 ,	400 23:17
\$129 23:17,	18.3% 33:3	3 4 : 1 7 ,	45.5% 33:3
23:18,	1969 29:6	2025 12:8,	46 46:10
24:2, 24:6	1974 29:7	30:19,	49 9:10
\$ 1 7 5 3 4 : 1 7	1974 29.7 1987 40:11	31:3, 31:4,	4th 32:18
ψ11 3 04.11	1301 40.11	01.0, 01.4,	7 t II 52.10

	account 31:3,	3:8,4:19,	ago 24:4
< 5 >	3 9 : 3	6:4, 8:18,	agreements
	achi eve 29:18 Act 29:7,	12:11,	29:15
5 - 4 27:9		14:1,	Al bany 12:22
50 8:8, 8:19	3 9 : 1 2	31:11,	Alex 2:6,
50% 33:5	actions 18:3	39:8, 40:23	2:7, 3:15,
5 5 5 : 1 7 ,	activists	Administratio	4:1,7:7,
5:20, 6:1	14:15	n 37:18,	7:17,
57 8:9, 8:14	actual 11:18,	39:5, 39:16	14:22,
5 t h 1 : 1 0	18:20	adopt 5:19,	26:11,
	actually	5:23, 8:7,	26:21,
< 6 >	20:15,	8:12	36:2, 39:2
	25:22,	adopted 6 4,	allies 44:23
6.3% 31:18	25:23	8:17	allowable
6.73% 34:21	Ad 4:7, 7:23,	advocate	39:8, 39:10
62% 33:19	16:13, 27:3	17:24	Already
6 5 2 2 : 5	Adams 39:5	advocated	11:15,
	Adan 2:12	10:2, 22:9	11:22, 12:2
~7×	add 13:16,	advocates	a mong 33:16
<7>	18:3	4:17, 10:7	a mo u n t 11:18,
7 1:13, 8:4,	added 11:21	affected 21:6	11:20
28:11	addition	afford 24:15	analysis 5:3,
	19:1, 32:1,	Affordability	4 3 : 6
<8>	33:13, 38:7	17:9,	Andrew 2:15,
	additional	18:12,	10:4
8 43:23	17:3, 35:11	21:5,	annual 29:19
8 % 4 1 : 2 2	address 13:5,	27:18,	Apart ment
80% 41:16 898 34:10	1 3 : 1 3 , 3 8 : 1 2 , 4 3 : 9	30:12,	6:7,8:6,
898 34:10		30:15,	8:8,8:14,
	adjourn 28:3	3 2 : 1 2 ,	2 4 : 1 4 ,
<a>	a djourne d	3 2 : 1 4 ,	
	28:9	3 3 : 1 7 ,	apart ments
abject 13:5,	adjust 11:6, 13:21	3 5 : 1 5	4:20, 8:21,
17:19		affordable	9:1, 10:19,
a b n o r ma l	adjusted 11:2	15:5, 15:8,	13:10,
29:13	Adjusting	36:10,	3 4 : 3 , 4 1 : 4
above 9:11,	12:5,	3 6 : 1 2 ,	Applause.
3 4 : 2 3 , 3 5 : 1 0 ,	3 9 : 1 7 ,	40:7,	16:15, 24:1
46:12	3 9 : 2 2 , 4 0 : 1 2	40:10,	appropriate
abuse 21:1	a djust ment	41:19,	35:21
abuses 17:16,	11:20,	4 3 : 1 2 ,	approved
17:17	11:20,	43:12,	1 1 : 2 0
access 35:3	14:4,	afloat 12:17	approxi mately
according	29:20,	aforesaid	37:20
3 9 : 1 6	30:12,	4 6 : 1 1	AQUI NO 2:5,
accordingly	4 2 : 1 2	again-but	3:13, 3:14,
29:11	adjust ments	37:7	7:5, 7:6,
23.11	a a j u s t me n t s	37.7	1.5, 1.0,

22.14	22:11	beginning	bubble 14:7
2 3 : 1 4 , 2 3 : 1 6 ,	23:11,		Budget 32:6,
24:2, 24:8,	2 4 : 7,	5:14 behalf 10:2,	4 5 : 5
24:2, 24:8,	24:7,	22:9	buil ding
25:5,	25:4,	behind 40:23	12:10,
25:5,	25:10,	beings 18:20,	12:10,
25:11,	25:10,	22:18	24:2, 24:5,
	26:1, 27:7,	beings. 22:16	30:18,
2 5 : 2 1 , 2 6 : 9 , 2 6 : 1 0	27:10	believe 35:20	30:18,
area 15:10,	availability	belong 21:8	35:2,
42:6, 43:9	3 0 : 4	below 11:2,	38:10,
arguments	available	11:6,	40:3, 40:4
16:20	12:5,	12:11,	buil dings
Ar ml ovi ch	27:23,	13:22,	6:11, 6:16,
2:6, 3:16,	30:11,	15:9, 16:4,	10:21,
3:17, 6:21,	3 3 : 2 4 , 4 0 : 2	36:13,	11:1, 11:4,
7:8, 7:9,	Ave 1:10	3 7 : 1 5	11:21,
14:20,	average 11:2,	below-median	12:3,
14:22,	32:16,	4 2 : 3	12:23,
14:23,	3 4 : 1 3 ,	Benefits	13:16,
26:2,	3 4 : 1 6 ,	19:5, 21:20	13:22,
26:12,	3 4 : 2 0 ,	better 18:9	14:7,
26:13, 36:2	3 4 : 2 3 ,	beyond 38:14,	18:14,
around 22:17	42:5, 42:7	4 5 : 3	20:12,
Arpit 2:9,	- /	bias 21:6	30:24,
3:21, 7:13,		billion 40:11	31:7,
26:17		Blasio 39:15,	3 4 : 1 3 ,
assistance	back 18:7,	3 9 : 2 1	3 4 : 1 6 ,
33:2, 33:7,	3 9 : 6	blatant 13:10	3 4 : 2 1 ,
3 3 : 1 1	balance	blunt 45:3	35:5, 35:8,
assuring 5:6	27:16,	Boards 35:7	40:7, 41:3,
atrocities	3 5 : 1 6 ,	body 23:1	41:9,
17:17	3 5 : 2 2	boiler 24:3	41:12,
Audience	balancing	bond 37:14	41:15,
8:23, 9:2,	15:18,	books 15:17,	41:20, 42:3
9:5, 9:8,	3 6 : 2 1	3 6 : 1 9	built 40:9
9:13,	bare 13:23	bound 15:22,	burden 23:21,
10:10,	barely 11:23	2 1 : 1 9	3 3 : 8 , 3 3 : 1 2
12:20,	Barrio 1:9	breakeven	burdened 33:3
16:16,	base 9:11	3 7 : 1 4	burdens 20:7
17:6,	Based 20:10,	Brian 2:16,	Burger 2:17
17:21,	3 1 : 1 1 ,	1 0 : 4	busi ness
18:4,	37:17, 39:6	brief 4:13,	20:22
18:15,	basic 40:22	1 4 : 2 4	businesses
19:10,	basis 34:22	bring 25:21	12:17,
20:4,	beg 21:15,	Bronx 42:3	18:14,
20:19,	2 2 : 2 4	Brooklyn	18:18,
22:22,	began 12:24	2 1 : 2 3	19:6, 20:13

busy 21:14	Christina	27:12,	15:2, 36:5
	2:11, 4:4,	35:5, 37:7	completely
	7:20, 26:24	closely 15:3,	20:11
< C >	circulated	35:8, 36:8,	complexity
c a l c u l a t e d	5:21, 8:9	3 7 : 1 0	3 0 : 1 7
10:12	circumstances	closing 23:4	complicated
call 3:12,	1 9 : 4	Co-research	2 1 : 1 4
7:3, 25:3,	cited 33:16	2:16, 2:17	component
2 6 : 8	cities 20:9	co-signed	27:20,
calling	Citizens	17:18	3 5 : 2 0
43:19, 44:7	32:6, 37:16	code 35:6	composite
calls 38:12	City 1:2,	COLA 37:18	3 9 : 7
capital	3:4, 3:9,	Col as 37:23	comprehensive
11:18,	10:15,	colleagues	30:24, 45:4
35:3, 45:5	13:4,	13:1, 17:1	compromise
cared 20:15	14:16,	collective	15:2, 36:5
case 18:12,	15:10,	1 0 : 5	Con 13:17
2 1 : 1 1	15:21,	College 21:24	concern 35:15
cause 43:23	16:4, 16:6,	Col u mbi a	concerned
Center 11:12,	27:21,	3 3 : 1 5 ,	3 5 : 1 3
3 2 : 4 ,	29:3, 29:5,	3 3 : 1 7	conclude
3 3 : 1 5 , 4 2 : 1	29:24,	combines 39:8	20:11
centered	30:9,	comes 14:6,	concluded.
3 0 : 1 4	35:20,	16:7, 37:8	28:12
certain 18:9	40:11,	coming 42:12	conclusion
certify 46:9	43:12,	c o mme n c i n g	27:23
Chair 1:18,	43:20,	3 : 1 0	condition
2:4, 3:4,	44:3, 45:1,	c o mme n t s	29:23,
29:3	4 5 : 4	4:13, 6:23,	30:15,
Chairs 31:9	Citywide	6:24, 7:3	40:24, 42:9
challenges	31:1, 34:1,	Commission	conditions
27:17,	3 4 : 1 4	3 2 : 7	30:18,
27:18,	civic 15:4,	commit ment	35:2, 35:5,
3 1 : 1 3 ,	3 6 : 9	5 : 1 1	35:9, 44:16
3 2 : 1 3 ,	civil 17:16	common 45:7	confirmed
3 2 : 1 5 ,	claims 10:6	Community	11:13
3 3 : 1 7	Class 6:6,	11:12,	conflict
change 23:7,	6:10,6:13,	15:14,	13:10
23:8, 37:1,	25:22,	15:15,	consensus
3 9 : 9	4 3 : 2 1	3 2 : 5 , 3 2 : 6 ,	3 7 : 1 4
Changes	clear 10:24,	3 6 : 1 7 ,	consi der
15:23,	11:19,	3 6 : 1 8 ,	5:16, 29:22
3 2 : 7 , 3 4 : 8	12:6,	4 1 : 1 7	consideration
charged 44:4	25:12,	compared	15:18,
Char mai ne	25:13	38:9, 42:7	16:9, 36:21
2:18, 10:5	clearly	compassion	consideration
chi I dcar e	17:23, 25:7	2 3 : 1	s 35:17
4 3 : 2 2	close 16:5,	competing	considered

3 2 : 1 1 , 3 3 : 2	12:13,	12:1, 33:11	declined
consistently	12:16,	customer	1 2 : 1 4
40:23	12:17,	3 8 : 1 7	declining
consumer 42:5	13:17,	cut 12:13,	11:3, 19:13
cont ai ni ng	15:23,	12:16,	decontrolled
6:11,	19:16,	3 9 : 1 7	9:10
30:22, 41:3	27:16,	cycl e 20:24	decrease
continue	30:3,		3 4 : 1 5
11:17,	31:17,		decreased
11:24,	3 1 : 2 1 ,	< D >	31:8, 41:10
12:18,	32:9,	daily 21:21	dedication
12:21,	3 3 : 2 2 ,	Danielle	5:11
13:21,	35:12,	2:17, 10:5	deep 27:18,
14:6, 18:6,	37:2,	Data 10:20,	3 2 : 1 2
20:7, 25:24	37:13,	11:16,	deeply 21:6
continued	38:8,	12:5, 12:7,	deferred 42:1
21:1, 33:16	41:13,	12:13,	defunded 14:8
continues	43:21,	16:1, 16:7,	defunding
13:18,	4 4 : 1 2	18:10,	11:1, 12:23
20:23,	counting 17:5	18:23,	degrades
29:10,	COUNTY 46:4	19:2, 30:7,	40:14
3 2 : 1 9	course 38:7	30:10,	dehumanizing
continuing	court 24:16	30:16,	20:24
35:12	cover 40:3,		
contract 33:6		30:19,	del 1:9
	40:22,	3 1 : 1 2 ,	delinquent
contrast	41:21	3 3 : 1 1 ,	41:23
3 9 : 2 0	covered 37:11	3 4 : 7 , 3 5 : 6 ,	demand 21:15,
control 19:19	Covi d 39:19	3 5 : 7 ,	2 2 : 2 4
controlled	CPI 15:21,	3 5 : 1 0 ,	de mande d 25:7
12:17	36:24, 37:7	35:11,	depend 38:5
conversation	create 20:21,	37:3, 37:8,	depends 45:7
4 3 : 1 0	4 5 : 1	4 3 : 5	depictions
coor di nati ng	creating	day 29:10	17:14
5 : 4	3 8 : 1 6	days 17:15	Despite 10:6
core 10:22,	crisis 14:11,	De 39:15,	detailed
12:3, 31:8,	1 4 : 1 6	3 9 : 2 1	3 1 : 1 1
41:9, 41:11	critical	deci mals	deteriorates
Corporation	27:19,	18:17	4 1 : 1
11:13,	35:16,	decision	determine 3:8
15:15,	35:19, 44:5	13:2, 23:8	determining
3 2 : 5 ,	cruel 20:11	decisions	4:18, 31:10
3 6 : 1 7 ,	cumulative	17:11,	devastating
4 1 : 1 8	3 7 : 2 0	18:13, 21:6	13:15
correct 46:11	c u mulatively	decline 12:4,	develop 35:7
cost 13:5,	3 7 : 1 6	12:6,	differences
30:4, 30:8	current 30:7,	3 4 : 1 2 ,	4 4 : 2 4
costing 40:10	3 8 : 9	3 4 : 1 8 ,	different
Costs 10:13,	currently	3 4 : 2 2	16:21,
	1		

4 3 : 1 7	down 14:6,	ensure 35:17,	excluding
difficult	32:17,	40:21,	3 3 : 1 0
13:2, 15:1,	32:23,	4 4 : 1 6	Executive
2 1 : 1 4	3 4 : 3 , 3 7 : 2 3	Enterprise	2:15
dignity 22:4,	drowning 19:8	11:13,	expect 16:2,
2 2 : 2 4	During 10:13,	15:15,	3 7 : 4
dire 19:4	39:4,	32:5, 36:18	expectations
directly 18:3	39:15,	entire 44:2	38:9, 38:18
Director	3 9 : 1 9	entities	e x p e c t e d
2:15, 2:16,	dwelling 6:16	2 0 : 2 1	3 7 : 1 3
2:17		equal 18:18	Expense
Directors		equally 35:16	30:16,
1:7, 2:3	< E >	especially	30:20,
directs 29:21	earlier 44:6	4:20,	3 1 : 4 , 3 1 : 5
di sagreement	easier 10:6	10:20, 41:2	expenses
4 3 : 1 0	easy 27:19	essential	10:14,
disclosed	e c o n o mi c	5:5, 22:19,	11:17
13:11	20:2, 29:23	27:20,	experi ence
discuss 44:24	Edison 13:17	40:3,	4:22
discussion	effect 38:2	40:18,	expert 32:2,
9:16, 9:21,	EHRLICH 2:8,	40:20,	4 3 : 5
16:13,	3:19, 3:20,	42:10, 44:8	expl anatory
26:8, 30:14	7:11, 7:12,	estate 29:24,	5:24, 8:13
discussions	9:21, 9:23,	3 0 : 2	explore 38:15
13:24,	10:11,	esti mat e	express 5:8
2 3 : 1 3	26:15,	15:22, 37:1	expressed
di spl a c e me n t	26:16	ETPA 29:8,	19:1
2 3 : 2 4	eight 22:9	29:17	extend 45:2
disruptive	EI 1:9	evening 3:3,	extremely
29:16	elected 13:4,	11:21,	3 4 : 1
distort 10:20	14:9,	16:14,	
distress	14:15, 25:8	16:17,	
11:19,	electrician	16:18	<f></f>
11:24,	2 4 : 2 2	events 22:12	face 31:13,
15:7,	e I e me n t s	everybody	32:19,
36:11, 38:5	3 1 : 2 0	9:17	4 4 : 1 1
divide 43:12	e me r g e d 4 4 : 5	everyone	faced 32:8
doing 29:21	Emergency	4:21, 16:18	faces 14:12,
dollar 15:11,	29:7, 29:9	evidence 42:1	19:3
16:4	enacted 29:11	Evil 21:3	facing 20:23,
domestic 22:1	encourage	evolution	27:17,
Done 14:17,	20:20	3 8 : 8	27:18,
19:14	encouragi ng	exaction	3 1 : 1 7 ,
dooming 13:22	3 4 : 7	2 9 : 1 4	3 2 : 1 3
Doug 1:17,	e n o r mo u s	e x c e e d e d	fact 19:15,
2:4, 3:4,	4 3 : 2 4	4 1 : 1 4	19:17,
4:9,8:1,	enough 22:18,	except i on a l	19:18,
27:5, 29:3	2 5 : 1 8	5:3	19:20,

19:24, 20:6	42:9, 44:11	form 6:1,	10:16,
factors 30:1	financially	8:15	12:18,
facts 19:12,	11:9	formula 31:10	13:4,
	financing	forward 11:7	13:4,
20:10	_	fought 45:8	
fail 13:13,	27:17, 30:4		20:21
13:19	find 24:23,	four 17:4	grandfather
Failing 40:13	4 4 : 2 0	fourth 16:18,	24:21
failure 11:8,	finding 45:7	17:8, 17:12	gratitude 5:9
11:9, 13:23	findings	FPI 33:15,	Great 14:23
failures 13:3	5:24, 8:13,	33:20, 37:7	greatest
fair 29:20,	29:8	free 10:18	4 4 : 1 9
3 1 : 1 0	First 4:15,	freeze 20:18,	greed 22:18
fairness 23:1	9:23, 9:24,	21:19,	grew 33:22
fairness.	15:19,	2 2 : 7 ,	gross 30:3,
2 1 : 2 3	36:23, 39:4	2 2 : 1 0 ,	3 2 : 2 2 , 3 3 : 9
fall 37:15	first-year	25:8, 25:9,	ground 45:7
Falling 34:24	4 3 : 3	25:24,	groups 40:8,
falls 13:20	Fiscal 15:19,	43:19, 44:7	4 3 : 1 7
families	16:6,	freezes 13:9	groups - which
3 3 : 1 8	3 3 : 1 4 ,	friends 20:17	4 4 : 1 8
family 20:16,	3 6 : 2 2	froze 39:23	growing 12:7,
2 2 : 1 0	five 4:22	frozen 39:5	3 2 : 1 5
favor 23:23	fixed 37:24	fully 13:11,	grown 33:21
favors 21:22	focusing	4 1 : 2 1	growth 20:6
f	4.0.4.0	fundamental	
federal 10:16	18:18	fundamental	guess 23:19
feel 17:22	FOLLOWING	4 4 : 1 9	guess 23:19 guideline
			_
f e e l 17:22	FOLLOWI NG	4 4 : 1 9	guideline
feel 17:22 fellow 4:16,	FOLLOWING 28:13, 31:19	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24	FOLLOWI NG 28:13,	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9	FOLLOWING 28:13, 31:19 follows 6:5,	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman 1 1 : 1 2,	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9,
f e e l 1 7 : 2 2 f e l l o w 4 : 1 6 , 5 : 9 , 9 : 2 4 f e l t 1 1 : 9 F E MALE 2 2 : 1 3 ,	FOLLOWING 28:13, 31:19 follows 6:5, 8:20	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman 1 1 : 1 2, 3 2 : 4, 4 1 : 2 4	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13,	FOLLOWING 28:13, 31:19 follows 6:5, 8:20 food 43:21	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman 1 1 : 1 2, 3 2 : 4, 4 1 : 2 4 f ut ure 2 7 : 2 0, 3 5 : 7,	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui del i nes 1:3, 3:5,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15	FOLLOWING 28:13, 31:19 follows 6:5, 8:20 food 43:21 for-profit	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman 11: 12, 3 2 : 4, 41: 24 f ut ure 2 7 : 2 0,	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui del i nes 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 FEMALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3	FOLLOWING 28:13, 31:19 follows 6:5, 8:20 food 43:21 for-profit 40:6	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman 1 1 : 1 2, 3 2 : 4, 4 1 : 2 4 f ut ure 2 7 : 2 0, 3 5 : 7,	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui del i nes 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3 f i g h t i n g	FOLLOWING 28:13, 31:19 follows 6:5, 8:20 food 43:21 for-profit 40:6 for. 22:21 force 12:12	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman 1 1 : 1 2, 3 2 : 4, 4 1 : 2 4 f ut ure 2 7 : 2 0, 3 5 : 7,	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui del i nes 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3 f i g h t i n g 25:24	FOLLOWING 28:13, 31:19 follows 6:5, 8:20 food 43:21 for-profit 40:6 for. 22:21 force 12:12 forecaster	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui del i nes 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MAL E 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3 f i g h t i n g 25:24 f i n a l 5:19,	FOLLOWING 28:13, 31:19 follows 6:5, 8:20 food 43:21 for-profit 40:6 for. 22:21 force 12:12 forecaster 37:13	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui del i nes 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4,
<pre>f e e l 1 7 : 2 2 f e l l o w 4 : 1 6 , 5 : 9 , 9 : 2 4 f e l t 1 1 : 9 F E MALE 2 2 : 1 3 , 2 5 : 1 5 f e w 4 : 1 3 , 1 2 : 1 6 , 2 1 : 1 7 , 4 1 : 3 f i g h t i n g 2 5 : 2 4 f i n a l 5 : 1 9 , 8 : 7</pre>	FOLLOWING	4 4: 19 f undamentally 4 3: 7 Furman 11: 12, 3 2: 4, 41: 24 f ut ure 27: 20, 3 5: 7, 4 3: 11, 45: 6 <g> gain 3 4: 9 generates</g>	gui deline 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui delines 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4, 29:19,
<pre>f e e l 1 7 : 2 2 f e l l o w 4 : 1 6 , 5 : 9 , 9 : 2 4 f e l t 1 1 : 9 F E MALE 2 2 : 1 3 , 2 5 : 1 5 f e w 4 : 1 3 , 1 2 : 1 6 , 2 1 : 1 7 , 4 1 : 3 f i g h t i n g 2 5 : 2 4 f i n a l 5 : 1 9 , 8 : 7 F i n a l l y 5 : 8 ,</pre>	FOLLOWING	4 4: 19 f undamentally 4 3: 7 Furman 11: 12, 3 2: 4, 41: 24 f ut ure 27: 20, 3 5: 7, 4 3: 11, 45: 6 <g> gain 34: 9 generates 40: 21</g>	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui del i nes 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4, 29:19, 32:12,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3 f i g h t i n g 25:24 f i n a l 5:19, 8:7 F i n a l l y 5:8, 21:18,	FOLLOWING	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman 11:12, 3 2:4, 41:24 f uture 27:20, 3 5:7, 4 3:11, 4 5:6 <g> gain 3 4:9 generates 4 0:21 Genesis 2:5,</g>	gui deline 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui delines 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4, 29:4, 29:19, 32:12, 35:21,
<pre>f e e l 1 7 : 2 2 f e l l o w 4 : 1 6 , 5 : 9 , 9 : 2 4 f e l t 1 1 : 9 F E MALE 2 2 : 1 3 , 2 5 : 1 5 f e w 4 : 1 3 , 1 2 : 1 6 , 2 1 : 1 7 , 4 1 : 3 f i g h t i n g 2 5 : 2 4 f i n a l 5 : 1 9 , 8 : 7 F i n a l l y 5 : 8 , 2 1 : 1 8 , 3 8 : 1 0</pre>	FOLLOWING	4 4: 19 f undamentally 4 3: 7 Furman 11: 12, 3 2: 4, 41: 24 f ut ure 27: 20, 3 5: 7, 4 3: 11, 45: 6 <g> gain 34: 9 generates 40: 21 Genesis 2: 5, 3: 13, 7: 4,</g>	gui deline 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui delines 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4, 29:4, 29:4, 29:19, 32:12, 35:21, 36:4,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3 f i g h t i n g 25:24 f i n a l 5:19, 8:7 F i n a l l y 5:8, 21:18, 38:10 f i n a n c i a l	FOLLOWING	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman	gui deline 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui delines 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4, 29:4, 29:19, 32:12, 35:21, 36:4, 36:4,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3 f i ght i ng 25:24 f i nal 5:19, 8:7 F i nal l y 5:8, 21:18, 38:10 f i nancial 15:7,	FOLLOWING	f undamentally 43:7 Furman 11:12, 32:4, 41:24 future 27:20, 35:7, 43:11, 45:6	gui deline 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui delines 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4, 29:4, 29:19, 32:12, 36:4, 36:13, 37:3,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3 f i ght i ng 25:24 f i n a l 5:19, 8:7 F i n a l l y 5:8, 21:18, 38:10 f i n a n c i a l 15:7, 30:15,	FOLLOWING	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman 11:12, 3 2:4, 41:24 f uture 27:20, 3 5:7, 4 3:11, 4 5:6 <g> gain 3 4:9 generates 4 0:21 Genesis 2:5, 3:13, 7:4, 23:14, 26:9 gets 24:21, 24:22</g>	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui del i nes 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4, 29:4, 29:19, 32:12, 35:21, 36:4, 36:13, 37:3, 37:12,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3 f i ght i ng 25:24 f i n a l 5:19, 8:7 F i n a l l y 5:8, 21:18, 38:10 f i n a n c i a l 15:7, 30:15, 30:18,	FOLLOWING	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman	gui deline 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui delines 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4, 29:4, 29:19, 32:12, 35:21, 36:4, 36:13, 37:3, 37:12, 38:7,
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3 f i ght i ng 25:24 f i n a l 5:19, 8:7 F i n a l l y 5:8, 21:18, 38:10 f i n a n c i a l 15:7, 30:15, 30:18, 36:11,	FOLLOWING	f undamentally 43:7 Furman 11:12, 32:4, 41:24 future 27:20, 35:7, 43:11, 45:6	gui deline 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui delines 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4, 29:4, 29:4, 29:12, 35:21, 36:4, 36:13, 37:3, 37:12, 38:7, 42:12, 43:4
f e e l 17:22 f e l l o w 4:16, 5:9, 9:24 f e l t 11:9 F E MALE 22:13, 25:15 f e w 4:13, 12:16, 21:17, 41:3 f i ght i ng 25:24 f i n a l 5:19, 8:7 F i n a l l y 5:8, 21:18, 38:10 f i n a n c i a l 15:7, 30:15, 30:18,	FOLLOWING	4 4 : 1 9 f undamentally 4 3 : 7 Furman	gui del i ne 15:3, 16:3, 36:7, 37:5, 37:9, 37:19, 38:1 Gui del i nes 1:3, 3:5, 5:2, 9:10, 13:21, 15:1, 15:9, 15:24, 29:4, 29:4, 29:19, 32:12, 35:21, 36:4, 36:13, 37:3, 37:12, 38:7,

GUPTA 2:9,	higher 34:24,	i i i 3 0 : 4	3 1 : 1 9 ,
3:21, 3:22,	38:1, 44:12	I magine 24:20	3 1 : 2 3 ,
6:20, 7:13,	hi ghli ght e d	i mpact 30:11,	39:10,
7:14, 9:14,	3 2 : 1 5	3 5 : 2	39:13,
26:17,	hike 13:17	i mportant	40:1,
26:18, 28:4	historically	16:24,	42:10,
	3 4 : 2 4	3 1 : 1 2 ,	4 4 : 1 4
	history 15:11	35:4, 35:17	increased
< H >	history-the	i mprovements	23:17,
habitability	3 6 : 1 5	4 0 : 4	30:21,
38:11,	Hoberman 2:16	i n. 37:8	3 1 : 2 ,
38:18	hold 38:19	incentive	39:22,
half 23:22	homes 19:23	3 8 : 1 6	41:7, 42:7
happens 14:10	hope 38:15	i n c l u d e	increases
happy 14:20	Hopefully	10:12,	13:14,
harder 21:17	25:11	10:14,	22:16,
hardest 45:8	Hotel 5:14,	11:17,	29:13,
hardships	5:17, 5:20,	27:24, 45:4	32:10,
2 3 : 3	5:24, 6:4	includes	3 9 : 1 9
harm 43:24	hotels 5:18,	10:18,	i n c r e d i b l y
headli nes	6:7,6:13	33:3, 39:23	10:19
3 0 : 1 9	household	including	incurred
health 18:18,	3 2 : 2 3	18:11,	10:13
3 5 : 1 4	houses 6:8,	30:1, 31:21	incurring
heal thcare	6 : 1 0	Income 10:8,	20:8
4 3 : 2 1	HSTPA 12:22	2 2 : 6 ,	i ndependent
heard 11:11,	human 17:15,	30:16,	1 4 : 5
15:4,	18:2,	30:20,	Index 16:7,
2 1 : 1 3 ,	18:20,	31:3, 31:5,	3 1 : 1 7 ,
22:7,	2 2 : 4 ,	3 2 : 1 4 ,	37:8, 42:5
3 3 : 1 4 ,	22:16,	3 2 : 2 3 ,	i n d e x e d 3 7 : 1 5
36:8,	2 2 : 1 8	3 3 : 4 , 3 3 : 5 ,	i n d i c a t e
37:10,	h u ma n i t y	3 3 : 2 0 ,	3 3 : 1 2 , 4 1 : 6
3 7 : 1 7	2 1 : 1 0	3 7 : 2 4 ,	i n d i c a t e d
Hearing 7:2,	hundreds	40:22,	3 2 : 2 0
9:20	10:18	4 1 : 1 4	i n d i c e s 3 0 : 8
hearings 3:7,	HVS 32:21,	Incomes	i n d u s t r y
4:22, 5:4,	3 2 : 2 4	3 3 : 2 1 ,	29:24
10:8,		37:23, 41:8	i ne qui table
23:22, 43:5		i ncompatible	2 1 : 1
hell 21:8	<1>	4 3 : 7	inequities
help 19:4,	i dea 15:20	increase 6:7,	17:17
19:8, 21:11	i gnore 19:5	6:9,6:12,	inflation
hereby 46:9	ignoring	6:14, 6:17,	11:3, 11:6,
hereunto	18:22,	8:22, 9:1,	12:5,
46:14	18:23,	9:4, 9:7,	12:11,
high 10:19,	19:1, 19:2	12:22,	13:22,
13:5, 13:16	ii 30:3	17:2,	13:23,

4.4.0	12.11		10.0
14:2,	13:14,	lagging 16:1	19:9
15:10,	19:16,	lags 11:16	likely 15:22,
16:5, 31:2,	31:21	landlords	16:5,
31:6, 32:9,	interest	19:17,	3 1 : 2 0 ,
37:6,	13:10,	20:1,	37:1, 37:7
37:12,	30:5,	38:17,	listen 21:18
38:8, 39:3,	3 4 : 2 0 , 3 5 : 1	3 9 : 1 2	live 24:24
39:17,	interesting	language	lives 21:14,
39:19,	15:21	5:19,8:7,	2 4 : 1 1
39:22,	i nvest ment	37:21	living 30:8
40:2,	2 4 : 6	large 38:4	loans 34:20,
40:12,	i nvest ments	last 3:6,	41:20,
40:14,	40:16	17:4, 26:3	4 1 : 2 2
40:23,	i nvolved	lastly 20:5	lobbyists
42:6,	4 1 : 2 0	Law 29:6,	2 0 : 2 1
44:11,	issue 30:17	29:18,	I ocated 41:9
4 4 : 1 5	i s s u e d 3 4 : 6	29:21	Lodging 6:8
inflation-adj	iterations	laws 29:10	Loft 8:6,
u s t e d	4 4 : 6	leading 36:9	8:8,8:14
3 2 : 1 6 ,	i v 30:5	lease 3:8,	I of t s 9:3
3 4 : 1 5 ,	ivory 18:17	8:22, 9:1	long 31:16,
3 4 : 1 8		leases 3:9,	3 5 : 1 3
inflation-the		14:4, 39:9,	long-term
3 6 : 1 4	< J >	3 9 : 2 4	13:19,
i nf rast ruct ur	j o b 18:10	least 23:20,	44:16, 45:1
e 44:5	jobs 10:6,	3 0 : 2 2 ,	I onger 35:1
i nj ustices	2 2 : 1 1	40:13,	longest
18:7	Jordan 2:10,	4 1 : 1 6	15:10,
i n s e c u r i t y	3:23, 3:24,	leave 24:13,	36:14, 45:8
17:19	7:15, 7:16,	2 5 : 2	look 30:24,
I NSERTED	14:18,	legislative	4 5 : 4
28:14	26:19,	2 9 : 1 1	looking 24:14
i n s i g h t s	26:20, 43:2	l e g i t i mat e	I ot s 6:16
5:10, 16:22	Joseph 24:11	1 6 : 2 0	I ove 14:15
installed	justify 24:6	l ender 41:18	I ow 33:20,
2 4 : 4		Less 6:11,	39:19,
l nstead		15:21,	4 0 : 1 9
17:13, 19:6	< K >	16:6,	lower 15:22
Institute	keep 12:16,	20:23,	lower-bound
15:20,	22:12,	3 6 : 2 4 ,	3 7 : 1
16:6,	35:4, 40:13	37:7, 40:2	I owest 34:6
3 3 : 1 4 ,	kept 40:19	level 11:24,	
3 6 : 2 3	kidding 22:14	29:20,	
i n s t r u c t		40:14	< M >
27:24		liberties	maintain
i n s u f f i c i e n t	<l></l>	17:16	4 4 : 1 5
2 1 : 2 0	l a c k 13:6	life 19:9	mai nt ai ni ng
insurance	lag 40:23	lifeguard	3 1 : 1 4 , 4 4 : 4

maintenance	measure	8:16	
12:14,	37:12,	money 20:2,	< N >
12:15,	3 9 : 7 , 4 2 : 6	40:2	n . 16:13
30:3, 42:1	me a s u r e d	monthly 42:5,	name 46:14
major 10:14,	3 1 : 1 6	42:7	narrow 45:3
11:17,	me d i a 17:15	Mortgage	natural 44:23
35:3, 41:18	me di an 32:22,	3 4 : 1 9 ,	near 34:5
majority	33:9	40:4, 41:22	nearly 4:19,
10:21,	Me di cai d	mot her 21:24	33:22, 34:9
11:8, 38:13	43:23	mot i on 5:18,	necessary
makers 23:8	me e t 21:21,	6:19,6:23,	11:23, 18:6
MALE 21:3,	38:17	8:3, 8:7,	necks. 22:17
21:8	MEETING 1:5,		
manage 44:3	3:6, 5:16,	9:12, 9:16, 27:9, 28:3,	need 19:4, 23:5, 25:14
Manager 2:18	6:3,8:17,	28:6	needed 35:3,
mandated	27:23,	motioned 28:4	4 3 : 1 1
10:15, 14:5 Manhattan	28:3, 28:9	motions 4:12	needs 13:23,
	meetings 3:7,	motivating 21:10	19:13,
10:22,	5 : 4		21:21,
12:3, 31:7,	Member 36:2,	move 5:18,	24:12,
41:10,	3 9 : 2 , 4 3 : 2 ,	5:23, 8:5,	24:13,
41:11	43:3	8:7, 8:12,	24:24,
manner 5:7	me mb e r s 5:9,	24:12,	40:22
MARC 46:7,	5:15, 5:21,	24:14	negative
46:17	8:9, 10:1,	moved 38:11	4 1 : 1 2
markedly 38:1	14:18,	mo v e me n t	nei ghbor
market 10:19,	20:17,	43:13,	2 4 : 1 0
37:14,	23:13, 26:5	43:18,	nei ghbors
37:15, 44:9	me mo 3 1 : 4 me s s a q e s		20:16 Neither 19:18
market-rate		moving 24:16	
4 1 : 3 match 4 4 : 1 4	4 3 : 1 7	MS 3:14, 4:6,	Net 10:8,
	metric 39:17	7:6, 7:22,	30:20,
matter 46:12	Metro 42:6	12:21,	34:9, 38:2,
matters 38:10	mi l i t a r y 2 1 : 2 0	23:16,	4 1 : 8 New 1 : 2 ,
maxi mum 9:11, 39:8, 39:10			
Mayor 14:5,	million 4:19 millions	24:19,	1:11, 3:4, 3:9, 4:16,
25:8, 39:21	20:14	25:5,	4:19, 5:11,
Mclaughlin	mi n d f u l 32:12	2 5 : 1 1 , 2 5 : 1 6 ,	
2: 15	mi ni mu m		14:15,
me a n 14:21	13:11,	2 5 : 2 1 , 2 6 : 1 0 ,	15:12,
me aningful	13:11,	27:2, 28:7	15:21,
17:10		multi-family	16:4, 16:6,
me a n s 2 4 : 1 0 ,	missing 22:12 mission-drive	3 4 : 2 0	20:15,
24:24,	n 43:14	multiple	24:3,
37:21,	mitigate 33:8	6:16, 22:11	25:23,
38:16,	modest 32:9		29:3, 29:5,
		Museo 1:9	
4 4 : 1 5	modified 6:3,		29:6,

29:24,	Nope 27:4	offered 38:12	operation
30:8, 32:4,	nor 10:8,	Office 2:18	10:13
3 4 : 5 ,	14:14, 23:2	officials	operations
3 4 : 2 0 ,	normal 10:13,	4:17, 13:4,	12:10
35:7,	18:1, 18:2,	13:8, 14:9	operators
36:16,	18:8, 23:7	of t e n 19:21	12:16,
40:9,	normalization	old 22:9	3 6 : 1 0
40:15,	17:18	older 11:4,	opposi ng
42:6, 45:7,	normalizing	13:15	4 4 : 2 1
46:2, 46:4,	17:13,	on-going	oppressive
46:9	20:24,	3 4 : 1 2	29:14
News 30:19	2 1 : 1 0	Once 11:19	option 20:18
next 12:7,	nor mall y	one 5:15,	oral 4:23
16:7,	16:21	5:17, 5:19,	Order 5:14,
21:17,	not - for - profi	6:5, 11:7,	5:17, 5:20,
3 1 : 2 3 ,	t 14:12	12:15,	5:24,8:6,
37:8, 37:11	not a b l e 34:11	20:8,	8:8,8:14
night 23:10	Notably 32:3	22:23,	organizations
No. 7:12,	Notary 46:8	27:19,	15:5, 32:3,
7:22,	not e 27:12	30:22,	36:9, 44:10
14:19,	not ed 31:9,	34:7, 39:4,	organize 18:6
26:10,	3 5 : 1 0	4 3 : 9	ot hers 33:16
26:16, 27:2	nowadays	one-third	Ot her wise
NOI 10:11,	2 4 : 2 0	23:18,	2 1 : 1 6
10:14,	nuanced 36:5	2 3 : 1 9	outcome 11:7,
10:17,	number 5:17,	one-year	27:13
11:3, 12:2,	5:20,6:1,	8:21, 9:4,	out come s 23:9
30:21,	6:5,8:8,	14:4, 15:3,	outlines
30:24,	8:9,8:14,	15:9,	27:13
31:6, 41:8,	3 4 : 5	15:11,	out paci ng
41:12,	numbers 19:21	16:3, 36:7,	3 2 : 9
4 1 : 2 1	NY 1:11	3 8 : 7	Out si de
n o n - p a y me n t	NYC 30:22,	openi ng	10:21,
4 4 : 1 3	3 4 : 9 ,	15:16,	12:3, 31:7,
Non-profit	36:24,	3 6 : 1 9	41:9, 41:11
15:7,	37:6, 37:7	operate 14:6	overall
15:12,	Nyc-area	operates 5:6	10:20,
43:14,	3 6 : 1 3	Operating	40:17
44:1, 44:10	NYU 11:12,	10:8,	Overcrowded
nonetheless	4 1 : 2 4	15:23,	25:5, 25:6
16:2,		30:3,	overni ght
3 3 : 1 2 , 3 7 : 4		30:20,	3 7 : 1 4
nonprofit	<0>	31:17,	own 23:24
15:5, 36:9,	objectivity	37:2,	owned 40:7
36:11,	5 : 5	37:12,	owner 35:12
36:16,	occupancy	38:8, 41:8,	owners 4:17,
40:7, 41:18	6:15	41:13,	10:3,
nooses 22:17	Oct. 42:8	4 4 : 1 2	12:12,
			1

14:14,	25:10,	4 1 : 1 5	politicians
20:22,	25:20,	percentages	13:13
27:17,	26:1, 27:7,	18:17	poor 43:20
30:17,	27:10	period 9:4,	portfolio
3 1 : 1 3 ,	Partners	9:7, 32:17	4 1 : 2 0
3 1 : 1 8 ,	15:16,	permanent	portion 44:3
35:2,	32:6, 36:18	9:19	position 13:3
35:19,	passage 39:11	permanently	positioning
40:3, 43:8,	passed 12:22,	11:6	20:3
43:14, 44:1	27:9	permits 34:6	positions
ownership	passes 8:3	persist 31:22	43:7, 44:21
40:6	past 10:23,	persistent	possibility
	3 2 : 1 0	3 2 : 1 5	20:1
	path 38:16	person 19:8	possible
< P >	paying 18:19,	personal 4:21	38:15,
P. M. 1:13,	19:21,	perspective	40:19,
28:11	22:5, 33:4,	1 6 : 1	4 3 : 1 1
pace 42:11	3 3 : 5	phase 37:24	possibly
pages 46:10	payments	physical	10:16
pages 40.70 pandemi c	40:4, 41:22	18:19,	post ed 5:21,
4 4 : 1 3	pension 24:22	19:13,	8:10, 9:19,
paragraph	People 17:24,	35:5, 35:8,	27:14
26:3	18:13,	40:14,	potential
parents 22:10	18:14,	40:24,	4 4 : 1 9
part 9:18,	19:20,	42:9, 44:15	Pouring 18:16
28:2	20:8,	physically	Poverty
participated	20:14,	11:10	17:20,
4:18	21:11,	place 46:11	3 3 : 1 5 ,
participation	21:13,	plain 37:21	3 3 : 1 9
16:16, 18:4	23:2, 23:6,	plead 21:15,	power 23:5,
participation	23:22,	22:2, 22:24	25:18
. 8:23,	25:23,	Please 3:12,	powers 38:14
9:2, 9:5,	37:24	9:21,	practices.
9:8, 9:13,	per 34:17	16:13,	29:17
10:10,	per-unit	22:7,	pre-1974
12:20,	3 4 : 1 3	2 2 : 1 5 ,	12:3, 41:9,
17:6,	percent 6:7,	23:13,	4 1 : 1 5
17:21,	6:8,6:12,	27:12	predomi nant I y
18:15,	6:13,6:17,	point 13:24,	41:2, 42:2
19:10,	8:22, 9:4,	14:3,	Present 3:13,
20:4,	9:7, 9:11,	19:22, 34:7	3:14, 3:17,
20:19,	11:2,	points 34:22,	3:20, 3:22,
22:22,	11:14,	43:19	3:24, 4:3,
23:11,	1 2 : 4 ,	Policy 15:19,	4:6,4:8,
23:15,	13:17,	16:6,	4:10
24:7,	14:2, 17:3,	3 3 : 1 4 ,	Presentation
2 4 : 1 8 ,	2 2 : 6	3 3 : 1 6 ,	31:5, 33:20
25:4,	percentage	36:23, 45:5	presented
,			

	1	1	
12:7,	20:22	14:14,	real 15:10,
3 1 : 1 2 ,	proceed 4:12	15:6, 41:19	16:3,
32:7,	proceedi ngs	Public 1:5,	21:13,
35:11, 41:6	2 8 : 1 1	3:7, 4:17,	29:24,
Preservation	process 4:14,	4:22, 5:4,	30:2, 31:6,
11:12,	4:18	10:3, 10:7,	35:15,
15:15,	productive	13:7,	3 7 : 2 0
3 2 : 5 ,	4 3 : 1 0	14:13,	real-dollar
36:17,	professional	16:10,	3 6 : 1 4 ,
4 1 : 1 7	3 7 : 1 3	17:23,	37:5, 38:3,
preserve	professionali	29:8,	3 8 : 4
19:14,	s m 5:5	3 0 : 1 4 ,	realities
20:12,	professionals	36:2, 39:2,	2 3 : 3
35:19, 42:8	3 2 : 3	43:2, 43:3,	reality 25:1,
preserved	profit 10:8	4 6 : 8	27:16
4 0 : 9	profiteering	purpose 29:12	realized
preserver	29:16	push 18:7	17:8, 38:8
19:9	profits 20:2	put 13:2	realizing
preserving	programs		4 4 : 8
3 1 : 1 5	40:10,		really 16:22
prevailing	4 3 : 2 2	< Q >	reason 35:13
3 0 : 1	projected	quality	receive 33:2
prevent[ing]	30:2, 30:8	3 1 : 1 4 ,	received
29:12,	projecting	38:11,	15:3,
29:13	3 1 : 2 2	3 8 : 1 2	15:18,
previous	properties	quarter 32:18	32:2, 36:6,
3 1 : 1 9	4 0 : 6	quite 16:5,	36:22,
Price 31:16,	property	3 7 : 7	4 3 : 1 6
3 4 : 1 2 ,	13:14,	quorum 4:11	receiving
3 4 : 1 3 ,	3 1 : 2 1		3 3 : 1 0
3 4 : 1 7 ,	proportion		recent 32:17,
3 4 : 2 4 , 4 2 : 5	3 3 : 1	< R >	3 2 : 2 0
prices 31:17,	Proposal	raise 21:16	recenter 21:7
3 1 : 2 3	5:15, 5:17,	raised 15:20	recognize
pri mary 42:5	5:19, 5:20,	raising 20:14	4:21, 31:13
Prior 5:16,	6:5,8:8,	rate 13:17,	reconcile
13:11,	8:19	15:9, 34:2,	43:6, 44:19
3 1 : 9 ,	prospective	3 4 : 2 0 ,	record 4:10,
3 4 : 1 5 ,	3 7 : 3	3 4 : 2 3 ,	9:19,
3 9 : 1 1	protect	36:13, 38:1	16:12,
private	18:13, 45:9	rates 13:22,	19:21, 28:2
14:14, 40:6	Protection	30:3, 30:5,	RECORD. 28:14
privileged	29:7, 39:12	30:6, 35:1,	reduced 39:16
24:9	prove 16:3,	4 4 : 1 2	Reed 2:10,
problem	3 7 : 5	rather 16:19	3:23, 7:15,
20:12,	providers	ratio 33:9	26:19, 43:2
20:14	14:12,	rationale	reflect 6:3,
problems	14:13,	27:13	8:17
P	1		1

reflected	3 3 : 1 3 ,	r e p e a t e d l y	result 11:3
34:19, 35:6	3 3 : 1 9 ,	13:13, 19:3	results
reflects	3 4 : 2 ,	Report 31:5,	15:17,
15:4,	3 4 : 1 2 ,	31:17,	3 6 : 2 0
30:17,	3 4 : 2 1 ,	34:9, 34:19	retired 24:22
36:8, 37:10	35:14,	reported	retrospective
reform 13:14	3 9 : 1 3 ,	10:17,	16:2, 37:4
r e g u l a t e d	40:16,	30:19,	reveals 30:24
15:5, 36:9,	40:10,	31:3, 31:4,	revenue 10:9,
38:17, 44:4	40:21,	3 2 : 2 1 ,	11:22
regulatory	41:1, 41:2,	3 2 : 2 4 ,	review 18:10,
3 8 : 1 4	41:7,	4 1 : 1 2 ,	29:22
related 18:11	41:12,	4 1 : 1 9	RGB 5:22,
relates 30:18	4 1 : 1 6 ,	Reporter 46:8	6:3,8:10,
r e l a t i v e	42:2, 42:9,	reporting	8:16, 9:19,
3 7 : 2 2	4 4 : 2 ,	3 5 : 8	10:23,
relevant 30:7	44:17, 45:2	reports 32:1	27:14,
relief 34:4	rent-to-incom	represent	27:24,
remain 38:14	e 33:9	3 6 : 4	30:19,
r e mains 34:1	rent. 22:7	represented	3 1 : 3 ,
Remember	rental 6:4,	15:1	3 1 : 1 6 ,
22:15, 23:6	8:17, 20:7,	representing	3 1 : 2 2 ,
remind 9:17,	29:15,	4 4 : 2	32:14,
2 3 : 4	33:2, 33:7,	represents	3 3 : 1 3 ,
remit 38:14	33:11,	37:19	34:8, 36:2,
r e mo v e d 4 4 : 9	4 1 : 1 4	request	36:6,
r e n e w e d 3 : 1 0	renters 33:21	21:15,	36:15,
rent - burdened	rents 10:19,	2 2 : 2 4	38:15,
19:22, 22:5	11:2, 11:6,	research 5:3,	39:2, 39:4,
rent-stabiliz	17:2, 11:0,	33:18, 41:5	39:7,
ed 3:8,	20:14,	reserves	3 9 : 1 6 ,
4 : 2 0 ,	· ·	11:18	
•	29:13,		39:17,
10:21,	29:15,	Residential	3 9 : 2 1 ,
11:8,	29:20,	6:6, 29:24,	41:5, 43:2
11:14,	39:13,	3 4 : 5	rid 25:19
13:9,	39:16,	residing 13:9	rightly
13:20,	3 9 : 1 8 ,	resist 18:7	38:19,
19:12,	3 9 : 2 3 ,	respect	4 3 : 1 9
19:19,	40:1,	12:24,	rights 17:15,
2 4 : 1 3 ,	40:13,	15:6, 36:11	17:16,
30:16,	40:18,	respond 3:13	43:13,
30:23,	4 2 : 3 ,	response.	43:18, 44:6
31:1, 31:7,	42:10,	7:1, 26:6	rise 12:18,
3 1 : 1 4 ,	4 4 : 1 4	responsibilit	3 1 : 2 3 ,
32:8,	repairs	y 10:1,	3 5 : 1 2
3 2 : 1 3 ,	12:14,	13:19	rises 41:15
3 2 : 2 2 ,	12:15, 40:3	rest 16:8,	rising 27:16,
3 3 : 1 0 ,	repeat 18:1	16:10	3 1 : 2 1 ,
	1	T. Control of the Con	A Company of the Comp

	1	_	1
32:8,	sales 34:12,	several 32:10	43:22, 44:5
43:21,	3 4 : 1 3 ,	severely 22:4	sold 34:17
4 4 : 1 2	3 4 : 2 4	sewer 13:16,	solely 20:12
risk 11:15	save 11:21	3 0 : 2	SOLTREN 2:12,
road 14:6	saw 12:13,	shape 19:13	4:7, 4:8,
Rob 9:21,	20:16	share 14:24,	7:23, 7:24,
9:22	saying 22:20	16:22, 17:8	16:14,
Robert 2:8,	scheme 29:11	shared 45:1	16:17,
3:18, 7:10,	school 22:5,	Shelter	17:7,
26:14	2 2 : 1 2	15:21,	17:22,
role 27:15	Schwartz 2:7,	16:7,	18:5,
roll 3:12	4:2,4:3,	36:24, 37:8	18:16,
r oll back	7:18, 7:19,	shift 10:24	19:11,
16:4, 37:6,	26:22,	short 18:19	20:5,
37:20,	26:23, 39:2	shortage 34:4	20:20,
38:3, 38:4	scope 45:3	Shorthand	21:4, 21:9,
rollbacks	season 17:8	4 6 : 7	22:15,
12:12,	Second 5:1,	show 4:10,	22:23,
15:11,	6:18, 6:20,	1 2 : 8	27:3, 27:4
3 6 : 1 5	6:21, 6:22,	showed 33:20,	solution
rolled 39:6	9:12, 9:14,	3 4 : 9 , 4 2 : 1	20:13
room 6:15,	9:16, 28:6,	shows 12:6,	solutions
24:12,	28:7, 28:9	3 3 : 1 8	20:22
24:14,	Section 6:16,	shrift 18:19	sol ve 14:11
24:15,	4 3 : 2 3	significant	s o me b o d y
24:17,	Security	31:11,	23:19,
2 4 : 1 9	22:19,	31:13,	23:20,
Rooming 6:10	24:21,	3 2 : 2 0	2 4 : 1 1
rose 31:18	37:18	similar 42:11	sources 18:11
route 16:21	Seeing 12:1,	simple 31:10	speakers
row 15:8,	17:1	Single 6:15,	38:13
16:4,	seek 23:2,	21:24	special 9:9,
17:12,	3 5 : 1 7	slated 37:24	10:4
3 6 : 1 2	seen 12:2	slowly 40:1	specifically
row-below	seni or 37:16	s mall 38:3	15:7
37:6	seniors 37:22	SMYTH 2:11,	speculation
RSL 29:6,	sense 19:7	4:5,4:6,	29:16
29:17,	Sept. 42:8	7:21, 7:22,	speculative
29:20	series 3:7	12:21,	29:12, 44:9
run 31:16	serious	27:1, 27:2,	spending
RUSSO 46:7,	14:11, 29:8	28:7	12:14
46:17	seriously	SNAP 43:23	spent 11:23
40.17	_		
	10:2	Social 15:12,	spiked 39:20
<\$>	servant 17:23	17:15,	spoke 25:7
	service 38:18	24:21,	spoken 10:7
Sadly 12:15,	set 17:2,	3 3 : 1 5 ,	Sros 6: 16
14:10	46:14	36:16,	SS 46:3
safety 43:22	setting 29:19	37:17,	SSA 37:23

SSD 23:20	statistics	3 2 : 1 5	systemi c
SSI 23:19	16:19	submissions	11:1, 11:7,
Stability	status 15:12,	4:24	12:23
35:18,	3 6 : 1 5	submit 16:8	systems 23:8,
3 9 : 1 1	Stay 17:23,	s u b mitted	25.21
stability.	19:23, 23:9	5:15, 6:1,	
22:19	steep 33:12	8:15	
Stabilization	Stenotype	submitting	<t></t>
29:6, 35:18	4 6 : 8	4:23	tanks 15:6,
Stabilized	step 15:16,	subsidy 38:13	36:10
13:16,	3 6 : 1 9	substantial	task 27:19
33:1, 34:8,	steps 18:6	4 4 : 3	tasks 29:19
3 4 : 1 0 ,	Stock 11:9,	substantially	t a x 13:14
34:16, 40:9	13:20,	6:1,8:14	Taxation
staff 5:2,	15:8,	suffering	38:13
6:2,6:3,	19:12,	18:2, 18:3	Taxes 13:14,
8:15, 8:16,	27:21,	sufficient	19:16,
10:4,	30:16,	40:22,	30:2, 31:22
27:24,	3 1 : 1 5 ,	4 1 : 2 1	teacher 22:5
3 1 : 3 ,	32:8, 34:8,	sum 35:10	television
3 1 : 2 2 ,	3 4 : 1 0 ,	summary 6:4,	17:14
32:1, 41:5	3 5 : 1 4 ,	8:19	Tenant 10:6,
stagnant	35:20,	super 24:5	24:9, 29:7,
4 3 : 2 0	3 6 : 1 2 ,	Superville	30:12,
st and ing	38:5,	2:18	30:14,
25:23	40:17, 44:2	supply 13:6,	33:17,
standpoint	strain 44:11	30:5, 33:24	35:15,
1 2 : 1 1	Street 1:10	support 42:11	3 9 : 1 2
starkly 43:16	stress 41:7	supportive	tenants 4:16,
start 9:21	stretch	14:13	10:3,
starting	15:10,	supports 25:8	19:20,
13:24, 14:3	3 6 : 1 4	Survey 32:21,	20:3,
State 10:15,	strike 35:21	3 4 : 1 9	20:24,
13:4, 29:7,	strong 23:9,	survivor 22:1	25:2, 25:6,
46:2, 46:9	2 5 : 1 8	sustainabilit	27:18,
state-level	structures	y 44:16	31:15,
4 5 : 5	18:19	swap 37:15	3 2 : 1 3 ,
st at e me n t	struggl e	Sy mp a t h y	32:16,
5:24, 8:13,	2 1 : 1 ,	22:20,	32:19,
14:24,	21:17, 35:2	2 2 : 2 1	3 2 : 2 2 ,
27:12,	struggles	system 21:2,	3 3 : 1 ,
27:22, 28:1	18:20,	3 5 : 1 8	3 3 : 1 0 ,
STATEMENTS	18:23, 19:1	system-now	3 3 : 1 3 ,
9:18,	student 21:24	4 4 : 2 0	35:19,
14:18,	studied 32:17	systematic	37:11,
16:12,	studies 33:14	10:24	38:6,
28:1,	Study 30:20,	systematicall	38:18,
0 0 4 0 0 0 0			
28:13, 29:2	31:4, 31:5,	y 14:7	40:19,

		1	
43:8,	5:12, 44:24	2 6 : 2	29:14
43:13,	tonight		unwarranted
43:18, 44:6	14:11, 28:1		29:12
tenants-with	too. 22:18	< U >	updates 10:15
3 3 : 8	took 15:16,	unabated	upgrades 35:4
t ensi ons	21:13,	1 2 : 1 9	urge 35:7,
4 4 : 2 0	3 6 : 1 8	unaccept abl e	4 4 : 2 3
term 14:8,	tools 45:4	18:9	urgent 38:12
34:5, 35:1,	total 17:4,	unaffordabili	urgently
3 5 : 1 4	4 1 : 1 4	t y 17:19	4 3 : 1 1
testified	total meanin	unaffordable	us-including
4:21, 37:17	g 41:13	2 0 : 9	3 0 : 1 1
testify 13:8,	t ot all y 16:20	unconscionabl	useful 15:22,
2 3 : 2 2	t owards 10:24	e 18:21	3 6 : 2 4
t e s t i moni e s	t ower 18:17	undeni able	utter 13:3
15:2, 36:6	track 35:8	4 4 : 1 1	
Testi mony	transcript	underscore	
11:11,	28:2	3 5 : 1 2	< V >
13:12,	transcription	understand	VA 21:20,
15:4,	4 6 : 1 2	13:1,	3 7 : 2 3
15:19,	transparent	20:17,	vacancies
15:20,	5 : 7	22:3, 23:2	3 9 : 1 0
16:9, 21:5,	traumatic	undisputed	Vacancy 30:6,
26:3, 32:2,	17:14	19:11	3 2 : 2 1 , 3 4 : 2
32:7, 36:8,	trend 12:6,	unelected	vacated 39:13
36:22,	3 4 : 1 1	2 3 : 1	value 17:9,
37:10,	trends 31:20	unfortunate	2 1 : 5
41:5,	troubled	10:17	various
41:24, 43:5	15:13,	unfortunately	18:10,
t h e ms e l v e s	3 6 : 1 6	2 9 : 1 0	4 0 : 1 0
19:22,	troubling	unit 30:23,	versus 38:6
4 4 : 2 0	15:17,	3 4 : 1 7	vet 21:20
t h e y ' l l 2 1 : 1 6	3 6 : 2 0	units 3:9,	veterans
t hough 32:23	true 30:23,	6:11, 9:10,	37:16,
t housands	40:5, 41:2,	34:10,	3 7 : 2 2
10:18	4 6 : 1 1	3 4 : 2 1 ,	viability
threats 43:22	try 22:3	3 9 : 1 3	13:19,
three 39:4	turn 5:13	University	40:15
t hr oughout	t wo 37:11,	3 2 : 4	video 4:23
3 0 : 2 2	37:21,	unj ust 29:14	vilify 14:15
throw 16:19,	39:23,	unlikely 34:4	violation
19:9	43:17,	unnoticed	3 5 : 6
tight 34:1	4 4 : 1 8	13:12	Violations
tightening	t wo-year 9:1,	unprecedented	1 2 : 2 1
2 2 : 1 7	9:7, 37:9,	15:16,	violence 22:1
Today 15:1,	3 8 : 6	3 6 : 1 9	vision 44:8,
3 6 : 4	type 25:19	unreasonable	45:1, 45:2
together	Typically	20:11,	vi t a l 31:15
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	1	

VOICE 21:3,	27:22,	37:8, 42:12
2 1 : 8 ,	3 1 : 2 2 ,	years 10:23,
22:13,	3 1 : 2 3 ,	15:8, 17:4,
25:15	37:5,	21:17,
voi ces 21:7	37:23, 38:5	22:9, 24:4,
volunteering	win 25:13,	3 2 : 1 0 ,
5 : 1 0	25:17,	3 6 : 1 2 ,
	25:17,	37:11,
vot e 7:3,	windows 24:4	
8:2, 23:23,		37:21,
26:9, 27:6,	wish 26:5	3 9 : 4 , 3 9 : 2 3
27:9	within 46:8	years- 30:14
vot es 8:4	WI TNESS 46:13	yelling 19:8
	witnessed	York 1:2,
	4 3 : 4	1:11, 3:4,
< W >	work 5:12,	3:9,4:19,
wage 20:6	5 : 1 4 ,	14:16,
wages 32:16,	22:11,	15:9,
4 3 : 2 0	25:22	15:12,
wanted 14:23,	working	15:21,
1 4 : 2 4	21:24,	16:4, 16:6,
war 25:19	25:22,	25:23,
Washington	4 3 : 2 0	29:3, 29:5,
2 4 : 1 2	world 20:9	29:6,
watch 14:8,	worse 11:19,	29:24,
3 5 : 5	1 2 : 8	30:8, 32:4,
water 13:16,	writing 16:9	36:16,
3 0 : 2	written 4:23	40:10,
website 5:22,		40:15,
8:10, 9:19,		42:6, 45:7,
27:14	< Y >	46:2, 46:4,
welcome 3:5	y'all 23:10	4 6 : 9
wheelchair	year 12:7,	Yorkers 4:16,
21:19	12:13,	5:11, 20:16
WHEREOF 46:13	13:3,	you. 22:20
whether 25:17	13:12,	y 5 u . 2 2 . 2 0
who've 10:7	13:12,	
will 3:12,	,	<z></z>
	14:2,	
5:16, 9:18,	15:14,	zero 6:7,
11:9,	16:7,	6:8,6:11,
11:21,	16:19,	6:13,6:17
12:7, 12:8,	17:3, 25:7,	
14:11,	30:13,	
16:8, 20:6,	3 1 : 1 9 ,	
21:18,	3 1 : 2 4 ,	
23:6,	32:11,	
25:15,	3 4 : 1 6 ,	
26:8,	35:21,	
27:13,	36:17,	